

Impact of Entrepreneurial Marketing, Internal Marketing and Organisational Commitment on Customer Loyalty with the Mediating Effect of Customer Satisfaction in the FMCG Sector of Pakistan

Muhammad Raza^a, Syeda Nazneen Waseem^b, Atif Aziz^c, ^aAssistant Professor Emaan Institute of Management & Sciences, ^bLecturer Karachi University Business School, ^cAssistant Professor Karachi Institute of Economic & Technology, Email: Sirraza81@gmail.com, Atif.aziz@pafkiet.edu.pk

The objective of the study is to examine the impact of entrepreneurial marketing, internal marketing and organisational commitment on customer loyalty with the mediation of customer satisfaction in the FMCG market of Karachi, Pakistan. The study has gathered 167 responses from the target population using convenience sampling method and five-point Likert scale questionnaire as data collection instrument. Partial Least Square (PLS) method to SEM has been employed as data analysis technique using SmartPLS version 3.0. The results revealed that entrepreneurial marketing and internal marketing have statistically significant influence on customer satisfaction. Whereas, the impact of entrepreneurial marketing on customer loyalty with the mediation of customer satisfaction has also found statistically significant but internal marketing does not contribute to customer loyalty. However, organisational commitment does not contribute to customer satisfaction and customer loyalty either. The study consequently concluded that utilisation of external and internal resources for customer-orientation would provide beneficial outcomes to FMCG firms in Pakistan. The study also provides some practical implications and future research recommendations.

Key words: *Internal Marketing, Entrepreneurial Marketing, Organizational Commitment, Customer Satisfaction, Customer Loyalty, PLS-SEM.*

Introduction

There has been a long debate among the researchers and practitioners for decades about adequate definition of internal marketing, Rafiq and Ahmed (2000). However, the one popularly accepted definition of internal marketing refers to empowering employees toward customer orientation, and customer-consciousness, Gronroos (1985). It comes up from the concept that customer satisfaction can be achieved by satisfied employees, Rony and Suki (2017). It also considers employees as internal customers and emphasises that organisations should be capable of selling the brand inside the organisation at first, Rafiq and Ahmed (2000). Besides the long debate and empirical studies on internal marketing, organisations are still not capable of implementing it to the optimum extent, Ahmed and Rafiq (2003). However, the concept of internal marketing is now incorporated into entrepreneurial marketing for better business management (Zampetakis & Moustakis, 2007).

Besides internal marketing, another emerging concept that has gained attention from practitioners, academics and researchers is entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial activities, and entrepreneurial marketing, Al-Manasra, Al-Zyadat, Al-Awamreh, and Alnsour (2013); Hernández-Perlines (2016); Jayawarna, Jones, Lam, and Phua (2014); Reijonen, Hirvonen, Nagy, Laukkanen, and Gabrielsson (2015); Rezvani and Khazaei (2013); Shows, Albinsson, and Stoddard (2016); Thourunrojroje and Racela (2013). The organisations are also paying adequate attention towards understanding possibilities of entrepreneurial marketing in the current scenario. It basically refers to allocation and utilisation of available resources and opportunities for market penetration, profitability and larger market share with innovative marketing tools and techniques, Shows et al. (2016). It has been greatly emphasised by researchers and practitioners in the near past that entrepreneurial marketing has significant importance for future growth, gaining competitive advantage and performance sustainability, (Hernández-Perlines, 2016; Reijonen et al., 2015; Thourunrojroje & Racela, 2013).

Further, the organisational shift from external factors to some sort of hybrid situation where the internal and external opportunities and resources have been taken into serious consideration. Therefore, one important concept of internal resource allocation and utilisation is the organisational commitment, Donavan, Brown, and Mowen (2004); Lau, Tong, Lien, Hsu, and Chong (2017); Yeh (2014). The concept of organisational commitment basically postulates psychological attachment of the employees with the organisation, Yeh (2014). In the recent past, it has become popular amongst researchers and practitioners in correlation with internal marketing, Abzari, Ghorbani, and Madani (2011); Caruana and Calleya (1998); Kashive and Khanna (2017); Tsai and Wu (2011). However, the employees' commitment toward organisational goals and focuses on customer-centric approaches, is the ultimate outcome elevating service quality, Dhar (2015). Therefore, it is concluded that organisational commitment leads to better service quality that eventually translate into satisfied customers

and finally, transform them into loyal customers, Conway and Briner (2015); Kashive and Khanna (2017); Lau et al. (2017).

Moreover, it has been identified by critical reviewing of past literature that the combination of internal marketing, entrepreneurial marketing and organizational commitment has capabilities of improving customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. In the past literature, the impact of organisational commitment to customer satisfaction and loyalty has been studied, Conway and Briner (2015); Kashive and Khanna (2017); Lau et al. (2017). Whereas, entrepreneurial marketing and orientation were also considered for various dimensions of customer and business management, Jayawarna et al. (2014); Reijonen et al. (2015); Shows et al. (2016); Thoumrunroje and Racela (2013). Also, internal marketing was considered enormously for understanding its implications for marketing and customer management, Azizi, Ghytasivand, and Fakharmanesh (2012); Bansal, Mendelson, and Sharma (2001); Gounaris (2008); Tsai and Wu (2011); Üzümcü, Günsel, and Yavaş (2017). However, a lack of evidence was found in regards to the combination of these management and marketing concepts to understand their implications on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Hence, the current research has aimed to examine the impact of entrepreneurial marketing, internal marketing and organisational commitment on customer loyalty with the mediation of customer satisfaction in the FMCG market of Karachi, Pakistan. In this concern, the study has taken some advance research methodology and incorporated sub-dimensions of internal marketing and organisational commitment to ensure their comprehensive role toward customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Therefore, as proposed by Caruana and Calleya (1998), three sub-dimensions of internal marketing including vision, development and reward, whereas, three sub-dimensions of organisational commitment comprising of affective, continuance and normative have been considered.

In the larger perspective, it has been acknowledged by numerous past literature that internal marketing plays vital role in advancing service quality in manufacturing and service industries, Barnes, Fox, and Morris (2004). It emphasised that internal customers are similarly important to organisations as external customers are and should be focused adequately to ensure sustainable service quality and customer-orientation, Barnes et al. (2004); Donovan et al. (2004); Joseph (1996); Kashive and Khanna (2017); Piercy (1995). Besides, the significance of entrepreneurial marketing and organisational commitment can also be taken seriously, Conway and Briner (2015); Dhar (2015); Donovan et al. (2004); Lau et al. (2017); Thoumrunroje and Racela (2013). Therefore, the study contributes significantly to empirical and theoretical literature, whereas, it has certain implications to practitioners and marketing personnel. Furthermore, the current research is divided into five sections including introduction that comprises of problem identification and research objective particularly, reviewing of the related literature and theoretical underpinnings for

hypotheses development, research method, data analysis and finally, conclusion and recommendations.

Literature Reviews

One of the oldest school of thoughts for strategic management and competitiveness is popularly known as resource-based view theory, Barney (2001); Colbert (2004); Mahoney and Pandian (1992); Peteraf (1993); Priem and Butler (2001); Wernerfelt (1984). It has enormous implications to allocation and utilisation of available resources in the external and internal business environment, Barney (2001); Colbert (2004); Wernerfelt (1984). The basics of strategic management lies in the concept of gaining competitive advantage and utilisation of organisational resources including human resource, finances, marketing strategies and capacity building, in the best possible manner, Colbert (2004); Mahoney and Pandian (1992); Peteraf (1993). Therefore, on the theoretical foundations of resource-based view theory, it was manifested numerous times that internal marketing and organisational commitment mainly focuses on capacity building and appropriate human resource management practices in the organisation, Abzari et al. (2011); Caruana and Calleya (1998); Dhar (2015); Kashive and Khanna (2017); Tsai and Wu (2011). Hence, past literature also emphasised that organisational commitment has three basic dimensions including affective, continuance and normative commitments, Albdour and Altarawneh (2014); Caruana and Calleya (1998); Garland, Lambert, Hogan, Kim, and Kelley (2014); Imam, Raza, Shah, and Raza (2013); Kim, Eisenberger, and Baik (2016); McCallum, Forret, and Wolff (2014). These three pillars combined together design a comprehensive organizational commitment. However, it has been manifested that organisational commitment helps to improve service quality that leads to customer satisfaction and ultimately translates the strategic efforts toward customer loyalty, Conway and Briner (2015); Dhar (2015); Donovan et al. (2004); Lau et al. (2017); Tsai and Wu (2011). Thus, it has been hypothesised that organisational commitment directly influences customer satisfaction, whereas, it affects customer loyalty with mediation of customer satisfaction.

H1a: Organisational commitment significantly influences customer satisfaction.

H1b: Organisational commitment significantly influences customer loyalty with the mediating effect of customer satisfaction.

There is an importance of employee development and capacity in becoming essential in the business management. History shows that companies thrived for customer orientation only through employee satisfaction and better customer services, Azizi et al. (2012); Rony and Suki (2017); Tsai and Wu (2011). Therefore, the internal marketing emerged as an important strategic method for lasting organisational benefits. The training, encouragement and empowerment of employees particularly improves their consciousness toward customer-

orientation, Azizi et al. (2012); Barnes et al. (2004); Donovan et al. (2004); Gronroos (1985); Joseph (1996). Besides plenty of empirical evidence, the resource-based view theory also postulates similar standpoint. It stressed that organisations should focus on appropriate allocation and utilisation of internal resources to enrich their possibilities of gaining competitive advantage, Barney (2001); Colbert (2004); Mahoney and Pandian (1992); Peteraf (1993); Priem and Butler (2001). Number of past studies also proposed that internal marketing has three basic dimensions encompassing rewards, development and vision, Caruana and Calleya (1998); Tsai and Wu (2011). Although, it has been manifested empirically that internal marketing impacts customer satisfaction significantly that eventually leads to customer loyalty, Abzari et al. (2011); Bansal et al. (2001); Barnes et al. (2004); Kashive and Khanna (2017); Piercy (1995); Rafiq and Ahmed (2000); Rony and Suki (2017); Üzümcü et al. (2017); Zampetakis and Moustakis (2007). Thus, the study hypothesised that internal marketing directly influences customer satisfaction, whereas, it affects customer loyalty with the mediating effect of customer satisfaction.

H2a: Internal marketing significantly influences customer satisfaction.

H2b: Internal marketing significantly influences customer loyalty with the mediating effect of customer satisfaction.

With the emergence of customer-orientated concepts and fierce competition in the market, Back, Parboteeah, and Nam (2014); Li, Gong, Li, Chen, and Guo (2015); Zhuang and Luo (2015), the organisational focus is directed towards exploiting available resources to the best possible extent, Nalcaci and Yagci (2014); Paladino, Widing, and Whitwell (2015). Therefore, the concept of entrepreneurial marketing emerges in the recent past decade, Hernández-Perlines (2016); Jayawarna et al. (2014); Niehm, Hurst, Son, Fiore, and Sadachar (2013); Reijonen et al. (2015); Rezvani and Khazaei (2013); Shows et al. (2016). As stipulated by resource-based view theory, the organisations should focus on developing capabilities and capacities to ensure effective utilisation of the resources, Barney (2001); Mahoney and Pandian (1992); Peteraf (1993); Wernerfelt (1984). The entrepreneurial marketing strategies can eventually optimise marketing performance and service quality, Al-Manasra et al. (2013); Jayawarna et al. (2014). The improvement in service quality encourages customer satisfaction and perhaps enhance customer loyalty in the wide perspective, Jayawarna et al. (2014); Thourunroje and Racela (2013). Similar theoretical and empirical evidences were revealed by past researches such as Hernández-Perlines (2016); Jayawarna et al. (2014); Reijonen et al. (2015); Shows et al. (2016); Thourunroje and Racela (2013). Hence, on the theoretical underpinnings of the resource-based view and empirical evidences, the study hypothesised the impact of entrepreneurial marketing on customer satisfaction and further it implicates to customer loyalty through satisfaction.

H3a: Entrepreneurial marketing significantly influences customer satisfaction.

H3b: Entrepreneurial marketing significantly influences customer loyalty with the mediating effect of customer satisfaction.

Finally, the manifestation of relationship between customer satisfaction and customer loyalty have been studied and revealed by massive number of recent past researches, Blut, Frennea, Mittal, and Mothersbaugh (2015); Chou, Lu, and Chang (2014); Jeong, Cha, and Jang (2016); Khan and Fasih (2014); Navickas et al. (2014); Zakaria et al. (2014). Therefore, the study also hypothesised that customer satisfaction significantly influence customer loyalty.

H4: Customer satisfaction significantly influences customer loyalty.

There has been numerous literatures available to discuss internal marketing, entrepreneurial marketing and organizational commitment. In this regards, Üzümcü et al. (2017) examined the impact of internal marketing on emotions of employee in the tourism industry of Kocaeli province of Turkey. The study has used 136 sample responses from the employees of tourism enterprises using survey method and five-point Likert scale questionnaire. For data analysis, SmartPLS 2.0 was used for Partial Least Square (PLS) SEM method. The results and findings revealed that internal marketing positively influenced two aspects of emotional labour of tourism employees including surface acting and deep acting. Furthermore, Kashive and Khanna (2017) investigated internal branding, brand commitment and organisational performance and showed that internal branding does have positive and constructive impact on organisational performance. Similar to the context, internal marketing also assists in developing organisational commitment and elevates service quality, Tsai and Wu (2011). It was found empirically that internal marketing helps to improve service quality with the mediation of organisational commitment. Perhaps, it asserts that internal marketing plays important role in enhancing service quality and organisational performance Barnes et al. (2004); Joseph (1996). Whereas, another important aspect of internal marketing is its implications to customer satisfaction and market-orientation, Abzari et al. (2011); Azizi et al. (2012); Paladino et al. (2015); Piercy (1995). Hence, it has been established that plenty of empirical literature exerts repercussions of internal marketing on various dimensions and it has certainly becomes vital for organisational sustainability and improvement (Azizi et al., 2012; Bansal et al., 2001; Caruana & Calleya, 1998; Donovan et al., 2004; Gounaris, 2008; Gronroos, 1985; Rony & Suki, 2017).

Furthermore, organisations that are investing their efforts and paying attention toward internal marketing also try to develop organisational commitment within their employees and large number of studies were conducted in this regards, Abzari et al. (2011); Bansal et al. (2001); Caruana and Calleya (1998); Donovan et al. (2004); Tsai and Wu (2011). Importantly, it has been revealed that organisational commitment does plays important role in business management, service quality improvement and customer orientation, Abzari et al.

(2011); Conway and Briner (2015); Dhar (2015); Kashive and Khanna (2017); Lau et al. (2017); Tsai and Wu (2011). These literatures particularly emphasise motivating and empowering employees to enrich the essence of customer orientation in the organisation, Abzari et al. (2011); Donovan et al. (2004); Lau et al. (2017). Rich empirical evidence found in support of promoting organisational commitment through employee engagement and job satisfaction, (Abzari et al., 2011); Albdour and Altarawneh (2014); Donovan et al. (2004); Imam et al. (2013); Yeh (2014). Interestingly, it was also disclosed by ample past literature that organisational commitment leads to customer satisfaction, Conway and Briner (2015); Laguador, De Castro, and Portugal (2014); Levesque and McDougall (1996). However, the three dimensions of organisational commitment including affective, continuance and normative were also taken into consideration for perceived organisational support, determination of employee commitment and others, Imam et al. (2013); Kim et al. (2016); McCallum et al. (2014). Hence, the critical literature review for organisational commitment and internal marketing can be summarised as two pivotal antecedents and determinants of customer orientation and satisfaction.

Finally, the recently emerging concept of entrepreneurial marketing for business management and to improve customer orientation, satisfaction and loyalty has sudden prominence in the literature, Reijonen et al. (2015); Thourmrunroje and Racela (2013). Sufficient studies were conducted in the past encouraging entrepreneurial marketing for competitive advantage, satisfaction and customer loyalty, Hernández-Perlines (2016); Jayawarna et al. (2014); Kilenthong, Hills, and Hultman (2015); Shows et al. (2016). The established facet of these studies lies upon the emergence, importance and applicability of entrepreneurial marketing for better market and customer orientation, Al-Manasra et al. (2013); Jayawarna et al. (2014); Niehm et al. (2013); Rezvani and Khazaei (2013); Zampetakis and Moustakis (2007). These studies focused on revealing the actual picture of entrepreneurial marketing in today's business scenario and thus, its pathway to customer satisfaction and customer loyalty is also highlighted prominently, Hernández-Perlines (2016); Reijonen et al. (2015); Thourmrunroje and Racela (2013). Therefore, magnificent numbers of recent studies explored the significance and need of understanding entrepreneurial marketing for practical applications.

Methodology

The study has used quantitative research approach and dealt with numerical terms and quantifiable data, Saunders, Lewis, and Thornhill (2015). The study used explanatory research purpose and correlational research design to elaborate the proposed model and achieve research objective appropriately. In this concern, the study has gathered primary data from various FMCG companies of Pakistan using convenience sampling technique. With 0.40 anticipated effect size and 0.90 desirable statistical power, minimum sample of 123 responses were estimated. Thus, total 200 questionnaires were distributed, whereas, 182

questionnaires were returned and only 167 responses were usable at the response rate of 83.5%. The study used five-point Likert scale questionnaire as data collection instrument. The measures for affective commitment, continuance commitment, normative commitment, vision, development and reward were taken from Caruana and Calleya (1998); measures of entrepreneurial marketing were adapted from Kilenthong et al. (2015); and measures of both customer satisfaction and customer loyalty were adapted from Amin (2016). For data analysis, the study has used Partial Least Square (PLS) method for structural equation modelling using SmartPLS software.

Data Analysis

In regards to data analysis, it has been considered as an important aspect to demonstrate respondents' profile. The following table 1 shows descriptive statistics of respondents' profile that were segregated into four categories comprising gender, age group, qualification and designation.

Table 1: Respondents' Profile

		Frequency	Percent
Gender	Male	114	68.3
	Female	53	31.7
Age	26 years to 30 years	56	33.5
	31 years to 40 years	101	60.5
	41 years and Above	10	6.0
Qualification	Graduate	108	64.7
	Post-Graduate	59	35.3
Designation	Assistant Manager	21	12.6
	Manager	122	73.1
	Director	24	14.4

Further, the study executed confirmatory factor analysis including two higher-order constructs namely organisational commitment and internal marketing. Firstly, the study has estimated construct validity and Tabachnick and Fidell (2007); Tabachnick, Fidell, and Osterlind (2001) suggested for construct validity, factor loadings should be greater than 0.50 in their respective first-order construct. The following table 2 shows result of construct validity.

Table 2: Construct Validity

	AFF	CL	CS	CON	DEV	EM	NOR	REW	VIS
OC/Affective7	0.93								
OC/Affective8	0.93								
CL1		0.83							
CL2		0.90							
CL3		0.84							
CL4		0.88							
CL5		0.87							
CS1			0.82						
CS2			0.79						
CS4			0.54						
OC/Continuance2				0.54					
OC/Continuance5				0.96					
IM/Development1					0.79				
IM/Development2					0.76				
IM/Development4					0.64				
IM/Development7					0.63				
IM/Development8					0.67				
EM1						0.80			
EM2						0.80			
OC/Normative6							0.97		
OC/Normative7							0.95		
OC/Normative8							0.94		
IM/Reward1								0.85	
IM/Reward2								0.74	
IM/Vision1									0.91
IM/Vision2									0.85

The above table showed that all the factors were loaded in their respective construct with factor loadings greater than 0.50 for each item. Hence, construct validity has been achieved. The study further estimated convergent validity using two basic parameters including Average Variance Extracted (AVE) with threshold value of 0.50 and composite reliability with threshold value of 0.70, as suggested by Fornell and Larcker (1981a, 1981b); Hair, Anderson, Babin, and Black (2010); Hair, Black, Babin, Anderson, and Tatham (1998). The following table 3 presents the results of convergent validity for all first-order constructs.

Table 3: Convergent Validity

Constructs	Composite Reliability	Average Variance Extracted
Affective Commitment	0.930	0.870
Customer Loyalty	0.936	0.745
Customer Satisfaction	0.767	0.531
Continuance Commitment	0.742	0.608
Development	0.828	0.493
Entrepreneurial Marketing	0.780	0.639
Normative Commitment	0.969	0.912
Reward	0.779	0.640
Vision	0.873	0.774

The above table showed that all the constructs have achieved convergent validity under suggested rules and thresholds. Lastly, the study has estimated discriminant validity using three methods namely Fornell and Larcker (1981b) criterion and Heterotrait-Monotrait (HTMT) ratio. The following tables show all these statistics for first-order constructs in the presentable manner.

Table 4: Fornell and Larcker (1981) Criterion

Construct	AFF	CL	CS	CON	DEV	EM	NOR	REW	VIS
Affective Commitment	0.93								
Customer Loyalty	0.08	0.86							
Customer Satisfaction	0.16	0.18	0.73						
Continuance Commitment	0.08	0.11	0.28	0.78					
Development	0.41	0.06	0.25	0.11	0.70				
Entrepreneurial Marketing	-0.11	0.06	0.32	0.19	-0.02	0.80			
Normative Commitment	0.39	0.01	0.15	0.14	0.62	-0.02	0.95		
Reward	0.05	0.25	0.34	0.21	0.23	0.20	0.14	0.80	
Vision	0.10	0.07	0.05	0.06	0.11	-0.02	0.18	0.02	0.88

In table 4 above, Fornell and Larcker (1981b) criterion for assessing discriminant validity has been presented. For achieving discriminant validity, Fornell and Larcker (1981a, 1981b) proposed that square-root of AVE for each construct should have greater coefficient contrasting all its respective vertical values. Hence, the above table shows that all the first-order constructs have achieved discriminant validity under Fornell and Larcker (1981b) criterion. Further, the following table 5 shows discriminant validity under HTMT ratio. The threshold for HTMT ratio has been suggested as all the constructs should have less than 0.85 coefficient (Henseler, Ringle, & Sarstedt, 2015).

Table 5: Heterotrait-Monotrait (HTMT) Ratio

Construct	AFF	CL	CS	CON	DEV	EM	NOR	REW	VIS
Affective Commitment									
Customer Loyalty	0.10								
Customer Satisfaction	0.23	0.21							
Continuance Commitment	0.18	0.19	0.54						
Development	0.52	0.13	0.38	0.26					
Entrepreneurial Marketing	0.18	0.10	0.63	0.45	0.18				
Normative Commitment	0.42	0.06	0.24	0.18	0.76	0.04			
Reward	0.09	0.39	0.68	0.52	0.38	0.44	0.20		
Vision	0.13	0.09	0.17	0.12	0.16	0.09	0.21	0.17	

The above table clearly shows that the study has achieved discriminant validity under HTMT ratio. Consequently, the study has achieved construct, convergent and discriminant validity under considerable thresholds. Therefore, the study has finally presented path analysis amongst the constructs in proposed structural model. The model has three first-order constructs namely affective commitment, continuance commitment and normative commitment comprised higher-order construct of organisational commitment. Whereas, higher-order construct for internal marketing consisted of three first-order constructs namely vision, development and reward. In this regards, table 6 represents the direct impact of organisational commitment, internal marketing and entrepreneurial marketing on customer satisfaction. However, it also shows the impact of organisational commitment, internal marketing and entrepreneurial marketing on customer loyalty with the mediation of customer satisfaction.

Table 6: Path Analysis

Structural Paths	Estimates	S.E.	T-Stats	Sig.
Organizational Commitment → Customer Satisfaction	0.06	0.11	0.51	0.608
Organizational Commitment → Customer Loyalty	0.01	0.02	0.44	0.657
Internal Marketing → Customer Satisfaction	0.28	0.10	2.81	0.005
Internal Marketing → Customer Loyalty	0.05	0.03	1.58	0.114
Entrepreneurial Marketing → Customer Satisfaction	0.31	0.08	3.77	0.000
Entrepreneurial Marketing → Customer Loyalty	0.06	0.03	1.87	0.063
Customer Satisfaction → Customer Loyalty	0.18	0.08	2.28	0.023

The results revealed that entrepreneurial marketing (0.06, $p < 0.10$) has significant impact on customer satisfaction and significantly impacts on customer loyalty (0.31, $p < 0.10$) through the mediation of customer satisfaction. Furthermore, internal marketing (0.28, $p < 0.10$) has significant impact on customer satisfaction and customer satisfaction (0.18, $p < 0.10$) has significant impact on customer loyalty. On the contrary, organisational commitment has no significant impact on customer satisfaction (0.06, $p > 0.10$) and it has no impact on customer loyalty (0.01, $p > 0.10$). Similarly, internal marketing also has no significant impact on customer loyalty (0.05, $p > 0.10$) through the mediating effect of customer satisfaction. In the similar context, the results also revealed that entrepreneurial marketing contributes most to customer satisfaction, followed by internal marketing. However, customer loyalty is greatly influenced by customer satisfaction.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The study has aimed to investigate the impact of entrepreneurial marketing, internal marketing and organisational commitment on customer loyalty with the mediation of customer satisfaction in the FMCG sector of Pakistan. In this regard, the results and findings of the study revealed that entrepreneurial marketing contributes to customer loyalty. However, customer satisfaction was influenced by internal marketing and entrepreneurial marketing efforts. Also, it has also been manifested that customer satisfaction leads to customer loyalty in the FMCG sector of Pakistan. On the contrary, organizational commitment does not contribute to either customer satisfaction or customer loyalty in FMCG sector.

Therefore, the study has concluded that FMCG companies of Pakistan should look forward toward implementing entrepreneurial marketing efforts in their organisations. The exploitation of resources to utilise them effectively and innovative techniques to marketing and promotion can help them to improve their customer satiation that ultimately leads to customer loyalty in the wider perspective. Moreover, the FMCG companies of Pakistan



should also pay proper attention towards developing organisational culture for internal marketing. Internal customers are preferably more important for consistent service quality and sustainability for competitive advantage to be achieved. However, the implications of internal marketing cannot be an easy task for FMCG sector but somehow, it has to be implemented for gaining competitive advantage and sustainable customer services.

In the perspective of future researches, the study specifically suggests to overwhelm the limitations of current study including smaller sample size, Karachi region, FMCG sector and some methodological inconsistencies. Therefore, future researches should focus on validating the implicative side of the current structural model. Theoretical framework and conceptualisation of the model can also provide substantial outcomes for knowledge and understanding about the nexus amid internal marketing, entrepreneurial marketing and organisational commitment for customer management. Though, novelty of research work would definitely provide some overwhelming dimensions but replication of the past research also provides well-versed structural models for practical implications in the real world scenario.

REFERENCES

- Abzari, M., Ghorbani, H., & Madani, F.A. (2011). The effect of internal marketing on organizational commitment from market-orientation viewpoint in hotel industry in iran. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 3(1), 147.
- Ahmed, P.K., & Rafiq, M. (2003). Internal marketing issues and challenges. *European Journal of marketing*, 37(9), 1177-1186.
- Al-Manasra, E., Al-Zyadat, M.A., Al-Awamreh, M.A., & Alnsour, M.S. (2013). Linking entrepreneurial marketing and performance indicators in jordanian hotel industry. *Journal of Management Research*, 5(3), 86.
- Albdour, A.A., & Altarawneh, I.I. (2014). Employee engagement and organizational commitment: Evidence from jordan. *International Journal of Business*, 19(2), 192.
- Amin, M. (2016). Internet banking service quality and its implication on e-customer satisfaction and e-customer loyalty. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 34(3), 280-306.
- Azizi, S., Ghytasivand, F., & Fakharmanesh, S. (2012). Impact of brand orientation, internal marketing and job satisfaction on the internal brand equity: The case of iranian's food and pharmaceutical companies. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 2(2), 122.
- Back, Y., Parboteeah, K.P., & Nam, D.-i. (2014). Innovation in emerging markets: The role of management consulting firms. *Journal of International Management*, 20(4), 390-405.
- Bansal, H.S., Mendelson, M.B., & Sharma, B. (2001). The impact of internal marketing activities on external marketing outcomes. *Journal of quality management*, 6(1), 61-76.
- Barnes, B.R., Fox, M.T., & Morris, D. (2004). Exploring the linkage between internal marketing, relationship marketing and service quality: A case study of a consulting organization. *Total Quality Management & Business Excellence*, 15(5-6), 593-601.
- Barney, J.B. (2001). Resource-based theories of competitive advantage: A ten-year retrospective on the resource-based view. *Journal of management*, 27(6), 643-650.
- Blut, M., Frennea, C.M., Mittal, V., & Mothersbaugh, D.L. (2015). How procedural, financial and relational switching costs affect customer satisfaction, repurchase intentions, and repurchase behavior: A meta-analysis. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 32(2), 226-229.



- Caruana, A., & Calleya, P. (1998). The effect of internal marketing on organisational commitment among retail bank managers. *International Journal of bank marketing*, 16(3), 108-116.
- Chou, P.-F., Lu, C.-S., & Chang, Y.-H. (2014). Effects of service quality and customer satisfaction on customer loyalty in high-speed rail services in taiwan. *Transportmetrica A: Transport Science*, 10(10), 917-945.
- Colbert, B.A. (2004). The complex resource-based view: Implications for theory and practice in strategic human resource management. *Academy of Management Review*, 29(3), 341-358.
- Conway, N., & Briner, R.B. (2015). Unit-level linkages between employee commitment to the organization, customer service delivery and customer satisfaction. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 26(16), 2039-2061.
- Dhar, R.L. (2015). Service quality and the training of employees: The mediating role of organizational commitment. *Tourism Management*, 46, 419-430.
- Donavan, D.T., Brown, T.J., & Mowen, J.C. (2004). Internal benefits of service-worker customer orientation: Job satisfaction, commitment, and organizational citizenship behaviors. *Journal of marketing*, 68(1), 128-146.
- Fornell, C., & Larcker, D.F. (1981a). Evaluating structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error. *Journal of marketing research*, 39-50.
- Fornell, C., & Larcker, D.F. (1981b). Structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error: Algebra and statistics. *Journal of marketing research*, 382-388.
- Garland, B., Lambert, E.G., Hogan, N.L., Kim, B., & Kelley, T. (2014). The relationship of affective and continuance organizational commitment with correctional staff occupational burnout: A partial replication and expansion study. *Criminal justice and behavior*, 41(10), 1161-1177.
- Gounaris, S. (2008). Antecedents of internal marketing practice: Some preliminary empirical evidence. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 19(3), 400-434.
- Gronroos, C. (1985). Internal marketing—theory and practice. *Services Marketing in a Changing Environment*, American Marketing Association, Chicago, IL, 41-47.
- Hair, J.F., Anderson, R.E., Babin, B.J., & Black, W.C. (2010). *Multivariate data analysis: A global perspective* (Vol. 7): Pearson Upper Saddle River, NJ.



- Hair, J.F., Black, W.C., Babin, B.J., Anderson, R.E., & Tatham, R.L. (1998). *Multivariate data analysis* (Vol. 5): Prentice hall Upper Saddle River, NJ.
- Henseler, J., Ringle, C.M., & Sarstedt, M. (2015). A new criterion for assessing discriminant validity in variance-based structural equation modeling. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 43(1), 115-135.
- Hernández-Perlines, F. (2016). Entrepreneurial orientation in hotel industry: Multi-group analysis of quality certification. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(10), 4714-4724.
- Imam, A., Raza, A., Shah, F.T., & Raza, H. (2013). Impact of job satisfaction on facet of organizational commitment (affective, continuance and normative commitment): A study of banking sector employees of pakistan. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 28(2), 271-277.
- Jayawarna, D., Jones, O., Lam, W., & Phua, S. (2014). The performance of entrepreneurial ventures: Examining the role of marketing practices. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 21(4), 565-587.
- Jeong, M.S., Cha, J.E., & Jang, D.-H. (2016). Impact of the service quality of horseback riding experience on customer satisfaction and loyalty-in case of jangsu horse riding experience course. *Journal of Korean Society of Rural Planning*, 22(2), 131-140.
- Joseph, W.B. (1996). Internal marketing builds service quality. *Marketing Health Services*, 16(1), 54.
- Kashive, N., & Khanna, V.T. (2017). Impact of internal branding (ib), brand commitment (bc) and brand supporting behavior (bsb) on organizational attractiveness (oa) and firm performance (fp). *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 7(2), 155-174.
- Khan, M.M., & Fasih, M. (2014). Impact of service quality on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty: Evidence from banking sector. *Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences*, 8(2), 331-354.
- Kilenthong, P., Hills, G.E., & Hultman, C.M. (2015). An empirical investigation of entrepreneurial marketing dimensions. *Journal of International Marketing Strategy*, 3(1), 1-18.
- Kim, K.Y., Eisenberger, R., & Baik, K. (2016). Perceived organizational support and affective organizational commitment: Moderating influence of perceived organizational competence. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 37(4), 558-583.



- Laguador, J.M., De Castro, E.A., & Portugal, L.M. (2014). Employees' organizational satisfaction and its relationship with customer satisfaction measurement of an asian academic institution. *Quarterly Journal of Business Studies*, 1(3), 83-93.
- Lau, P.Y.Y., Tong, J.L.T., Lien, B.Y.-H., Hsu, Y.-C., & Chong, C.L. (2017). Ethical work climate, employee commitment and proactive customer service performance: Test of the mediating effects of organizational politics. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 35, 20-26.
- Levesque, T., & McDougall, G.H. (1996). Determinants of customer satisfaction in retail banking. *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 14(7), 12-20.
- Li, Y., Gong, B., Li, P., Chen, Z., & Guo, N. (2015). Study on the risk elusion of brand extension in business startups.
- Mahoney, J.T., & Pandian, J.R. (1992). The resource-based view within the conversation of strategic management. *Strategic management journal*, 13(5), 363-380.
- McCallum, S.Y., Forret, M.L., & Wolff, H.-G. (2014). Internal and external networking behavior: An investigation of relationships with affective, continuance, and normative commitment. *Career Development International*, 19(5), 595-614.
- Nalcaci, G., & Yagci, M.I. (2014). The effects of marketing capabilities on export performance using resource-based view: Assessment on manufacturing companies. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 148, 671-679.
- Navickas, V., Navikaite, A., Abeyrathne, U., Jayarathne, S., Kılıç, S., Chen, Y.-L., . . . Er, S. (2014). Methodological aspects of customer satisfaction: Measurement and models. *Human Resources*, 3(8), 49-58.
- Niehm, L.S., Hurst, J.L., Son, J., Fiore, A.M., & Sadachar, A. (2013). Entrepreneurial marketing: Scale development and validation in the small firm context.
- Paladino, A., Widing, R., & Whitwell, G. (2015). Internal and external organisational orientations: Comparing the resource based view and market orientation *Global perspectives in marketing for the 21st century* (pp. 338-338): Springer.
- Peteraf, M.A. (1993). The cornerstones of competitive advantage: A resource-based view. *Strategic management journal*, 14(3), 179-191.
- Piercy, N.F. (1995). Customer satisfaction and the internal market: Marketing our customers to our employees. *Journal of Marketing practice: Applied marketing science*, 1(1), 22-44.



- Priem, R.L., & Butler, J.E. (2001). Is the resource-based “view” a useful perspective for strategic management research? *Academy of management review*, 26(1), 22-40.
- Rafiq, M., & Ahmed, P.K. (2000). Advances in the internal marketing concept: Definition, synthesis and extension. *Journal of services marketing*, 14(6), 449-462.
- Reijonen, H., Hirvonen, S., Nagy, G., Laukkanen, T., & Gabrielsson, M. (2015). The impact of entrepreneurial orientation on b2b branding and business growth in emerging markets. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 51, 35-46.
- Rezvani, M., & Khazaei, M. (2013). Prioritization of entrepreneurial marketing dimensions a case of in higher education institutions by using entropy. *International Journal of Information, Business and Management*, 5(3), 30.
- Rony, N.I., & Suki, N.M. (2017). Modelling the relationships between internal marketing factors and employee job satisfaction in oil and gas industry. *Asian Social Science*, 13(3), 135.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2015). *Research methods for business students*.
- Shows, G.D., Albinsson, P.A., & Stoddard, J.E. (2016). Entrepreneurship marketing in north carolina’s wine industry.
- Tabachnick, B.G., & Fidell, L.S. (2007). Multivariate analysis of variance and covariance. *Using multivariate statistics*, 3, 402-407.
- Tabachnick, B.G., Fidell, L.S., & Osterlind, S.J. (2001). *Using multivariate statistics*.
- Thoumrungroje, A., & Racela, O. (2013). The contingent role of customer orientation and entrepreneurial orientation on product innovation and performance. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 21(2), 140-159.
- Tsai, Y., & Wu, S.W. (2011). Using internal marketing to improve organizational commitment and service quality. *Journal of advanced nursing*, 67(12), 2593-2604.
- Üzümcü, T.P., Günsel, A., & Yavaş, A. (2017). The consequences of internal marketing activities on emotional labor in tourism industry. *Journal of Human Sciences*, 14(2), 1909-1923.
- Wernerfelt, B. (1984). A resource-based view of the firm. *Strategic management journal*, 5(2), 171-180.



- Yeh, Y.-P. (2014). Exploring the impacts of employee advocacy on job satisfaction and organizational commitment: Case of taiwanese airlines. *Journal of Air Transport Management*, 36, 94-100.
- Zakaria, I., Rahman, B.A., Othman, A.K., Yunus, N.A.M., Dzulkipli, M.R., & Osman, M.A.F. (2014). The relationship between loyalty program, customer satisfaction and customer loyalty in retail industry: A case study. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 129, 23-30.
- Zampetakis, L.A., & Moustakis, V. (2007). Fostering corporate entrepreneurship through internal marketing: Implications for change in the public sector. *European Journal of Innovation Management*, 10(4), 413-433.
- Zhuang, X., & Luo, Y. (2015). Relevance between the degree of industrial competition and fair value information: Study on the listed companies in china. *Journal of Industrial Engineering and Management*, 8(3), 894.