Investigating the Moderating Role of Terrorism Fear on the Relationship between Economic Value and Teachers Job Satisfaction: Evidence from Education Sector

Dr. Noor Ul Hadia*, Ayesha Darb, Ghayur Ahmadc, Dr. Malik F. Salehd,  

da,c,dCollege of Business Administration, Prince Mohammad Bin Fahd University, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, bDepartment of Business Administration, Foundation University Islamabad, Email: a*h_hadi1@yahoo.com, bayeshadar1@live.com, cmarchingdawn@gmail.com, dmsaleh@pmu.edu.sa

This study aims to examine the impact of economic value on teachers’ job satisfaction in the presence of fear of terrorism in the mind of teachers. To this end, data was collected through self-administered questionnaires from 175 faculty members of educational institutions in Peshawar purposively. 150 responses were analysed via hierarchical regression. The result of the study indicated that there is a positive and significant relationship between economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction. The study also found that the moderating role of fear of terrorism on the relationship between economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction is insignificant. The results deviate surprisingly; indicating that Pakistan is a developing country and has economic depression so people in Pakistan specifically in KP Province are more concerned about their economic value even in the presence of terrorism fear. The study also provides justifications, implications and future research opportunities.

Key words: Economic Value, Employees’ Teachers’ Satisfaction, Terrorism Fear, Employer Branding, Educational Institutions.
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

Job satisfaction is related to employee’s perception about the job (Asaali, 2020; Rue & Byars, 1992). Many researchers have found that job satisfaction has an undeviating association with human emotions, moods, behaviours, and attitudes. Job satisfaction is based on different factors like rewards, work-life balance, organisational justice, organisational support, work conditions and many other job and work-environment related aspects. Economic value as a dimension of employer branding is one of the most important factors of job satisfaction as they deal with wellbeing of an employee. The benefits an employee receives at the work place are measured as rewards (Malhotra, Budhwar & Prowse 2007). Rewards have a positive impact on satisfaction and enhance the satisfaction level of an employee regardless of the nature of organisation (Raza et al., 2020; Husey & Hussey, 1997). Employment rewards are therefore a main source of employee job satisfaction. Economic value (rewards) is of two categories: “financial rewards” and “non-financial rewards”. The “financial rewards” comprise of salaries, wages, bonuses, profit sharing, gain sharing etc. whereas “non-financial rewards” are insurance plans, sick leaves, privilege leaves, status, recognition, training etc.

Companies use economic value to satisfy employees and encourage them to do tasks professionally which engenders enthusiasm. This satisfaction has a sustainability issue amid the fear of terrorism. Since Pakistan is one of the major countries facing the menace of terrorism, it makes a case to discuss economic value in the context of Pakistan. Undoubtedly job satisfaction is important but the level of satisfaction reduces even if the employee is getting high economic value when there is a fear of terrorism in his/her mind. It can cloud concentration paving way for a lesser satisfaction. Meaning that fear of terrorism squeezes job satisfaction and can catalyse turnover intentions as terrorist attacks are assumed to create a sense of helplessness and fear that is more persistent and pervasive; also associated to other types of tragedies (TM perspective). Terrorism distresses humanity on the whole and creates turbulence in society. Chaos replacing the peace at large and personal safety becomes the most prioritised concern. Almost every country in the world is facing problems related to terrorism and countries once known as violence-free and adobes of humanity are prey of terrorists. Pakistan’s uniqueness is it is one of the top most countries having severe and direct terrorism issues. In the past, terrorists attacked a number of work places to create vulnerability, anxiety and economic problems in society. Reade (2009) stated “the studies available on the psychological response of employees to terrorism have mostly been conducted following the events of 9/11 and engrossed primarily on industrial employees in the United States”. However, how employees in educational institutions may be affected by terrorism remains nebulous.

Over the last one and a half decades, many educational institutions have been targeted by terrorists in many countries e.g. in 2004 there was a massive terror attack on school children in Beslan, Russia. The most heart-wrenching incident in Pakistan was the Peshawar school massacre in 2014 swallowing 141 lives, mostly children between the ages of 5-15. One of the
reasons why terrorists may choose to attack educational institutions is the intense media coverage they seek, providing a platform from which they can advance their cause, gain attention, and amplify panic (Perl & Raphael, 1997). After this attack, branded educational institutions are on the terrorist’s hit list and it creates fear among employees. According to Hadi and Ahmed (2018), employer branding traditionally consisted of seven dimensions: interest value, application value, development value, social value, economic value, management value and work-life balance; and recommended another dimension called psychological value. They proposed that employers should provide psychological value to their employees which help in reducing their future terrorism fear.

**RESEARCH MOTIVATION**

Many researchers carried out studies to know the psychological response of employees to terrorism after the World Trade Centre attacks commonly known as 9/11 attacks. The main focus of all this research was employees working in industries within America. Not much research is around on this subject in Pakistan, a big victim of terrorists' nefarious actions (recent attack on Peshawar Public School). Therefore, this study will investigate and analyse the relationship between economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction in educational institutions of Pakistan while also accounting for fear of terrorism. This relationship is also strongly suggested by Hadi and Ahmed (2018) in their recently published article.

**LITERATURE REVIEW AND HYPOTHESES DEVELOPMENT**

The parent paradigm of this study comes from the “Terror Management Theory” and “Herzberg’s Two Factor Theory”. Two Factor Theory is also well-known as “Motivation Hygiene Theory”. Herzberg’s theory describes that the factors responsible for satisfaction and motivation are dissimilar. He explains that “the opposite of the job satisfaction is not job dissatisfaction but rather no satisfaction” (Herzberg, 2003). This concept states that satisfaction and dissatisfaction is an outcome of different factors which are called motivation factors and hygiene factors; their absence and presence affecting the satisfaction.

Motivation is a feeling that drives individuals to acquire organisational or personal goals whereas hygiene factors include aspects of “working condition”, “interpersonal matters”, “organisational policies”, “job securities” and so on (Ruthankoon, 2008). The motivation factors on which job satisfaction depends are accomplishment, gratitude, responsibility, work itself and opportunities while the hygiene factors causing job dissatisfaction are compensation, working conditions, security and interpersonal relationship status. Thus, we posit that economic value will positively and significantly affect teachers’ job satisfaction in educational institution of Pakistan. Terror Management Theory (Greenberg, Pyszczynski, & Solomon, 1986) states that humans have agony and fear related to the awareness of mortality and inevitability of death. The gravity of fear related to death affects the relationship between economic value and job satisfaction.
Based on the above backdrop, this study conceptualises economic value and fear of terrorism as demonstrating overall job satisfaction. There are various factors which impact job related attitudes and fear is one of them. Terrorism promotes fear and can have an adverse effect on job associated attitudes (Malik & Abdullah, 2014).

**JOB SATISFACTION AND ECONOMIC VALUE**

Job satisfaction is a positive evaluative outcome one makes about the job (Weiss, 2002). It describes how much an individual is content or happy with their job. Job satisfaction therefore is a satisfying or constructive emotional state resulting from the appraisal of one’s job (Locke E., 1973). Positive attributes and feelings of people towards their job have a direct impact on their performance (Pushpakumari, 2008). The major goal of organisations is to enhance the performance of employees so they can increase the level of productivity (Butler & Rose, 2011). Productivity of employee is highly correlated with employee satisfaction as satisfied employees show a sense of responsibility, creativity, and commitment with their work Yousaf and Hadi (2020), Raza et al. (2020), Latif et al., (2019), Mahmood et al., (2019), Hadi and Ahmed (2018), Kiani and Hadi (2017), and Waheed et al., (2017). This positive evaluative outcome is a strategic asset of an organisation. Organisations not only require talented employees but also motivated and psychologically balanced employees to enhance productivity and their performance. A number of factors like salary, promotion, the work itself, relationship with co-workers and promotion prospects create job satisfaction (Opkara, 2002). The most important aspects of job satisfaction in the current study are conceptualised as economic value - extrinsic rewards.

The word reward refers to the state of benefits that workers receive from their jobs (Kalleberg A., 1977; Mottaz, 1988), these rewards positively and significantly affect employees’ job attitudes such as “job satisfaction”, “commitment” and “motivation” (Waheed et al., 2017; Steers & Porter, 1991). Thus, rewards play a significant role in building and nourishing the commitment among employees that leads to job satisfaction and high standard performance (Wang, 2004). Job satisfaction is certainly a measure of the satisfaction level of employees with its economic value (Zaini, Nilufar & Syed, 2009; Milne, 2007).

Economic value plays a vital role in determining job satisfaction (Pearson, 1991). As the needs of families are growing and living costs are becoming expensive so every employee desires higher income that can result in a secure future and job satisfaction. If an employee realises that he is not compensated well a feeling of dissatisfaction will likely develop. Small amounts paid to employees are not productive for job satisfaction. Nominal bonuses and incentives are neither helpful in coping with the price hike nor increasing living standards so the amount has no leverage on job satisfaction. There is a significant negative relationship between small bonus payments and the satisfaction of workers with the job itself (Poulakis, 2010). Flashily and Pappas (2002) explored that employees with fixed salary have low satisfaction and high
turnover intentions. Moreover, research suggests that the reason of turnover is low salary (Lawler, 2003). Hadi and Ahmed 2018 proposed that when employee’s psychological values as well as their economic value are satisfied, they tend to stay in the same job for a longer time. Thus, it is hypothesised that:

H1: There is a positive relationship between economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction.

JOB SATISFACTION AND FEAR OF TERRORISM

Terror can occur in any part of world, however, most incidents happen in the “Middle East”, “South Asia” and “Africa” (Enders & Sandler, 2006). In Pakistan, government buildings, schools, hospitals, shopping malls, hotels and many others places have been the targets of terrorists. Over the past ten years, many educational institutions have seen a number of terrorist attacks. In terrorism literature Sharon (2008) “there is a consensus that a major objective of the criminal terrorist acts is to disrupt society by provoking intense fear”. Little attention is paid to ongoing reactions and fears; and particularly how anticipating future terrorist attacks affect people’s functioning to move forward (Sinclair, 2010).

The psychological consequences of terrorism are not confined to how individuals respond in the wake of distinct terror attacks. Apart from the precious life loss these attacks can engrave fear on the minds of people working there. Anticipation of future terrorist attacks can also be particularly devastating in terms of emotional functioning (Somer, Tamir, Maguen, & Litz, 2005). Sinclair and LoCicero in 2007 developed the Terrorism Catastrophizing Scale (TCS). TCS has three subsets: “rumination”, “magnification” and “helplessness”. The rumination concept is related to the time and vigour that is expended thinking about possible risk (Sinclair, 2010). Finally, feebleness sets in mind when people consider they can’t do anything to change reality. Scant researchers have considered the impact of external factors on employee attitude especially in the context of ongoing terrorism (Reade, 2009; Reade & Lee, 2012). Terrorism has adverse effect on job related issues such as job satisfaction (Hadi & Ahmed, 2018). Reade (2009) established that employee understanding of terrorism is negatively related to the satisfaction of employees and other job-related attitudes. Thus it is hypothesised that:

H2: Fear of terrorism in the mind of the employees moderates the relationship between economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction.

METHODOLOGY

The design of this study is hypothetico-deductive and therefore tests the hypotheses via quantitative approach. Further, we favoured a purposive sampling technique over other sampling methods as the population of the study is only terrorism affected educational institutions. 175 Closed-ended questionnaires were given to respondents to gather data. The data used in this study was collected from educational institutions in Peshawar affected most
by terrorism attacks. Since the participants of this research were located in KP province, postal services were used in this research for sending and receiving questionnaires. Services of qualified personnel were hired to enhance the number of response rate. Data was analysed via hierarchal regression model.

**MEASURES**

Each questionnaire consists of 4 parts, which are demographics profile, fear of terrorism, economic value, and teachers’ job satisfaction. The questions used to measure fear of terrorism were taken from the TCS (Sinclair & LoCicero, 2006). The items of questionnaires to measure economic value were adopted from Heneman and Schwab (1985). The questionnaire items which are related to job satisfaction are adopted from Filtvedt (2015).

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The purpose of this research was to inspect the direct effect of economic value on teachers’ job satisfaction of employee and to analyse the influence of economic value on satisfaction of job in the presence of fear of terrorism in branded educational institutions of Pakistan. The objectives are as follows.

**Objective 1:**

*This study uses hierarchal regression analysis to check the direct association between economic value and job satisfaction.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effects without moderator</th>
<th>Path</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Std. error</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>p value</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Economic value → teachers’ job satisfaction</td>
<td>0.674</td>
<td>0.052</td>
<td>11.110</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The findings present significant association among economic value and job satisfaction as it is hypothesised. According to Table 1, value of t is 11.110 with a p-value of 0.001 hence it is less than 0.05 which means that hypothesis is accepted.

**Objective 2:**

*Fear of terrorism in the mind of teachers’ moderates the relationship between economic value and job satisfaction.*
Hierarchal regression analysis is used in the second step to examine the moderating role of the fear of terrorism over economic value and satisfaction of job.

Table 2: Moderating Effect

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardised Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardised Coefficients</th>
<th>p-values</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2(Constant)</td>
<td>-0.043</td>
<td>0.499</td>
<td>-0.087</td>
<td>0.931</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV</td>
<td>0.444</td>
<td>0.193</td>
<td>0.515</td>
<td>2.302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOT</td>
<td>0.321</td>
<td>0.189</td>
<td>0.330</td>
<td>1.698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV*FOT</td>
<td>0.010</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>0.050</td>
<td>0.148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 depicts that β for interactive effect is 0.010, followed by t = 0.148 and p = 0.813 suggesting that hypothesis is not supported. The results deviate surprisingly from the hypothesised standards by showing that the moderating role of fear of terrorism over economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction is insignificant. Results indicate that Pakistan is a developing country and has economic depression so people here are more concerned about their economic value than fear of terrorism. It is also quite extraordinary in the sense that for them terrorism is not a remote possibility but quite imminent. Terrorism has thwarted the lives and livelihoods of many around them having an array of dreams shattered into pieces in no time. Meticulously thought-out plans don't exist anymore. Getting along with routines of life is probably easier said than done in such circumstances. Like in 2005 when an earthquake hit the Northern parts of Pakistan, everyone was fearful for days. People stopped going to their job places and pulled back their children from attending educational institutions. But after a few days when the aftershocks were continuously occurring, people’s fear wiped away and they became prone to the situation thus, the same may be the case with fear of terrorism. However this situation is well explained in Protection Motivation Theory. The current phenomenon fits this theory well as the theory discusses how individuals can be motivated to react in a self-protective way towards any kind of threat and bring change in their behaviour. According to this theory one makes assessment of the dangers and then acts according to their evaluation. For instance a person feels that terrorism is there but his/her own vulnerability of becoming a bite of it, holds low probability so they will not be succumbing to fear. Another possibility could be the religious bondage of people. People of KPK are considered more deeply religious than any other part of Pakistan having a strong faith in Islam. Religious people derive the concept of death and life from their religion tightly holding and preaching a narrative that it is with the God and any evil force no matter how mightier can't harm you. There is a day destined for them in the grave; etched in the books of fate by the God and no satanic force can cast its nefarious design upon them. This religious perspective may be instrumental in brushing aside terrorism fear.
Also it is not unusual that many people work across the borders to find a safer environment and better wages. But it is also strange that many Pakistani are working in Afghanistan which is affected by terrorism mainly. The main reason of working in Afghanistan is the high wages which people are earning in dollars. So, they are compromising on their psychological values and enjoying economic value. Moreover, high unemployment rate and high inflation makes people concentrate more on economic value rather than self-protection. Although the maxim goes “money can't buy you everything” for the poor money exclusively fulfils their social needs and therefore they bow to the economic values. Thus, people don’t bother about terrorism because their survival hinges upon economic value calling it the best deal in given circumstances.

CONCLUSION

Conferring to Herzberg Two Factor Theory (1959), job satisfaction depends on dual aspects i.e. motivation and hygiene factors. According to (Herzberg F., 1969) hygiene factors can cause job dissatisfaction. Since, economic value is also a hygiene factor it can also have a similar effect on teachers’ satisfaction. The conclusions of the current study also underscore that there is a robust linkage between economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction. Moreover, an increase in economic value will cause an increase in teachers’ job satisfaction and hence creates motivation for teachers’ to achieve organisational goals. Whereas, it was also hypothesised that fear of terrorism in the mind of teachers moderates the association between economic value and teachers’ job satisfaction but the results revealed that people in Pakistan are impervious to the impact of fear of terrorism on job satisfaction. A possibility for this result could be that Pakistan is a developing country and people have less access to jobs providing high economic value so they give more preference to economic value than to psychological factor i.e. fear of terrorism.

This study gives a clear understanding that when the level of economic value is high then the level of teachers’ job satisfaction also rises. A unique aspect of this research is that fear of terrorism does not diminish the association between economic value and job satisfaction. The present research also provides a comprehensive understanding of the relation of economic factors, fear of terrorism and teachers’ job satisfaction. In order to improve satisfaction and drive away the terrorism fear, investment in employees is mandatory as it will also increase the level of their performance.

LIMITATION AND FUTURE RESEARCH DIRECTION

This study has several limitations. Sample size of the study particularly constraints the ability to generalise it to a larger population. However, the main reason behind small sample size is that data was only collected from terrorism affected educational institution in Peshawar Pakistan. Furthermore the current study is only conducted in branded educational institutions and excludes all unbranded forms of educational institutions let alone the other industries.
facing the wrath of terrorists putting more limits on its generalisability. Results of insignificant moderation effect are conclusive only within the constraints described above. However, findings of the study provide avenue for future research in this area by adding other factors to reach the core of how economic value can subvert the fear of terrorism.
REFERENCES


Eastman, J. A. (2009). The effects of expected evaluation and reward on motivation and creativity in Turkish children,. Massachusetts. , Brandeis University Waltham,.


Filtvedt, R. E. (2015). Motivation and Job Satisfaction: does Herzberg's "two-factor" theory apply to knowledge workers of today?


Psychological Bulletin 108 (2), 171-94.


Somer, E., Tamir, E., Maguen, S., & Litz, B. T. (n.d.). Brief cognitive behavioral phone-based intervention targeting anxiety about the threat of an attack:


Warwick and Lininger. (1975).


