

# Crafting Green Halal Tourism: Enhancing the Nation's Competitiveness

Sri Widyastuti<sup>a\*</sup>, Sudarmin Parenrengi<sup>b</sup>, Fatima Tuzzahara<sup>c</sup>, <sup>a,b,c</sup>Faculty of Economic and Business, Universitas Pancasila, Email: [a\\*widyastuti.sri@univpancasila.ac.id](mailto:widyastuti.sri@univpancasila.ac.id)

This research aimed to examine some determinants of tourism services, tourism infrastructure, human resources, and government policies in green tourism frameworks that influence the nation's competitiveness. The sample of analysis in this study is domestic tourism, taken purposively as many as 322 domestic tourists who had visited tourist attractions in Bogor, Yogyakarta, and Jakarta more than 3 times. This research found that halal-based tourism services do not affect green tourism, but the infrastructure, resources, and government policies affect green tourism conversely. This research also found that the tourism service has not played many roles in realizing the nation's competitiveness, and yet the infrastructure, resources, and government policies are influential.

**Key words:** *Green halal tourism, nation's competitiveness.*

## Introduction

The 2018 data released by the Institute for Management Development (IMD), reports that Indonesia experienced a decline in position to level 43 in the World Competitiveness Ranking. This is due to a decline in tourism and employment, public finance, and increasing concerns about the education system. Data from the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO, 2017), notes that the tourism sector contributes to 10% of the world's GDP, 7% of global trade and contributes to the tourism sectors. More than 17 Development Goals Sustainable/SDG, are managed in an integrated and balanced manner.

Referring to Biggs, D. et al., (2014), tourism was a funding source that is important for conservation efforts and increasing tourism income. The most effective factors influenced by sustainable developments are facilities and services, providing capital, and effective product

marketing to develop entrepreneurship (Hosseinzade, et al., 2018). Furthermore, data from the Travel and Tourism Competitiveness Index (TTCI) officially issued by the World Economic Forum (WEF) 2017, found that Indonesia's position had risen to 50 and is projected to rise into the top 30 positions in the world. Due to this, the development of the tourism sector needs to continue as in 4- or 5-years Indonesia's tourism industry can match nations like Thailand or Malaysia.

Furthermore, the PEW Research Center conveyed data that the fastest growing religion in the world is Islam, with more than 1.6 billion people or about 23.4 percent of the total world population identifying as Islamic. By 2050, it will increase to 2.8 billion with the majority of these individuals coming from the Asia Pacific region. Muslims constitute the majority in 49 countries in the world and with a total of 209 million Muslims or 87.2 percent of the total population, Indonesia is the country with the largest Muslim population. Suid, et al., (2017) explored the concepts of Islamic tourism and Islamic attributes because they can be used as a basis for targeting market segments of Muslim tourists. Thus, the Muslim travel market continues to grow rapidly and will grow steadily to reach US \$ 300 billion in 2026, Master Card and Crescent rating (2018) in the Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI). In 2017, there are an estimated 131 million Muslim visitor arrivals globally and this is expected to continue to grow to 156 million visitors in 2020, representing 10 percent of the tourism travel population.

In 2020, it will be estimated that the number of Muslim tourists will increase to 156 million tourists and these tourists will represent 11 percent of spending, around US \$ 220 billion [see Master Card and Crescent rating, 2018 in the Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI)]. Malaysia continues to be at the top of the index for the eighth consecutive year of world halal tourism destinations, while Indonesia is still in second place, up one level from 2017 and it is projected that in 2019 Indonesia will be ranked first. Mataram city in Indonesia won the 2015 Best Halal Destination Award and the 2015 Best Halal Honeymoon Award, which became a driver to enliven halal tourism potential in various provinces or regions in Indonesia. The data of the Halal Travel Indicator (HTI) released that Indonesia is a country that has natural beauty, heritage and cultural traditions that are abundant in the world. Meaning that Indonesia's main strength was natural tourism (Wibisono, 2017). The green economy is aimed to simulate green economic policies in key sectors, including, for example, agriculture, energy, industry, tourism, waste, and water (Andrea, 2016). The concept of ecotourism is expected to be able to guarantee the distribution of economic benefits to the community and local government and to maintain environmental sustainability.

## **Literature Review**

Islamic tourism is a very promising tool because there is a lot of interest, combined culture

andreligious attributes that are often synonymous with halal branding (Kessler, 2015). Halal tourism according to Farahani & Henderson, (2009); Jaelani, (2016); Munirah & Nizam, (2012); Wuryasti, (2013), is a tourism sector that serves to Islamic holidays, by adjusting to the needs and requests from Muslim travellers. Therefore, Islamic tourism is utilised to give travellers a journey to contemplate magic and enjoy the beauty of the universe created by Allah SWT. Shafaei & Mohamed, (2015) stated that Malaysia has become a popular Islamic tourism destination in the world, and has built a halal hub for financial services, Islamic tourism and halal. Elaziz & Kurt, (2017); Kamali, (2012) explain the aspects of Islamic tourism, related to sharia guidelines, and market developments. The prevailing popular culture has changed the religious lifestyle in terms of the perceived modern needs, and the perception of religious tourists about holidays as one of the basic needs of life.

### ***Tourism Services / TS***

Parasuraman's service quality measurement (1988) developed the Servqual model. Nasrin, et al., (2014) describe that mental images have a positive effect on perceived value and customer satisfaction, and the value perceived by the customer has a positive effect on customer satisfaction and customer satisfaction has a positive impact on behavioural intention. Findings by Hefer & Cant, 2014; Tawinunt, et al., (2015) stated that service quality and customer relationship management will respond better in the buying needs and habits and contribute to management's strategic planning that builds better customer satisfaction standards. The needs of Muslim tourists as a whole must be considered as Halal needs are rooted into the Muslim lifestyle (Islam, 2013; Putra, et al., 2016). The task of service providers is to provide tourism products as well as services that are in line with Islamic values, especially Islamic non-physical attributes, significantly affecting customer satisfaction only as moderation of religiosity.

### ***Human Resources / HR***

HR plays a role in observing, controlling and improving the quality of tourism, equally as important is the community around the tourist area that determines comfort, the satisfaction of tourists visiting the tourist area (Setiawan, 2016). Ervina, (2017) concludes that the lack of HR capacity in the tourism sector was due to the lack of education and training carried out by the regional tourism agency. Tourism requires human capital, practice, and the performance of a high-performing human resources department, and individual HR performance, as well as the strategic human resources that are specific in each country (Juan, et al., 2017). According to Sedarmayanti, 2014; Warsitaningsih, (2002) the development of tourism human resources was related to the development of knowledge about service procedures related to the variety of tourism activities.

### ***Tourism Infrastructure / TI***

Infrastructure improvements will be able to improve the national competitiveness in the tourism sector. According to Wibisono, (2017), Indonesia's current weakness due to the lack of tourism infrastructure services, namely in terms of readiness in the field of Information and Communication Technology (ICT). ICT is an important factor for a country's tourism industry, because it is advocated for the tourism industry to rely on the internet network, ranging from ticket providers, travel agents, restaurants, and hotels. Murphy, et al., (2018) found that the willingness to pay and demographic factors (including age, income, nationality, education, etc.) in Fiji emerged from partnerships between local communities and the tourism sector. Moyzeova, (2018) assesses the ecosystem services aim at the protection and conservation of natural capital and the development of green infrastructure.

### ***Government Policy / GP***

The Indonesian Ministry of Tourism created the Halal Tourism Development Acceleration Team. In 2016, the Indonesian Sharia Council of the Indonesian Ulama Council (DSN-MUI) had issued Decree Number 108 / DSN-MUI / X / 2016 concerning the Guidelines for Organizing Sharia-based Tourism. Then followed by the Indonesian Ministry of Tourism who issued a Decree of the Indonesian Minister of Tourism KM.40 / OT.001 / 2018 regarding to the Logo of Tourism Indonesia and the Indonesian Halal Tourism Logo in order to support the development of halal tourism in the region. The government of West Nusa Tenggara as well has issued the regulation No. 2 of 2016 which focuses on halal tourism. Followed by the Governor of West Sumatra who issued a Decree on the Integrated Team of the West Sumatra Province Tourism Development Acceleration which consisted of all Regional Device Organizations, activists and professionals in the tourism sector. Li & Hunter, (2014) involved the community stakeholders to achieve sustainability in heritage tourism operations, with a focus on inter-party group collaboration, participatory decision making, responsibility, and benefit sharing and building institutional strength structures to engage the organizing community. Hieu & Rasovska, (2017) work shows that the role of stakeholders in cultural tourism in Vietnam. Hobbs, (2017) states that local inheritance elements in the United Arab Emirates can be incorporated into contemporary planning and design for social sustainability based on the way of life and preferences of the local people, especially in kinship and Islamic values.

### ***Green Tourism / GT***

Green economy strategies need to be integrated with international and national development

goals (Vaghefi, 2015). et al., (2013) argue that there are doubts about how to create a business in innovative green companies among developed and developing countries and how the concept of a green economy is understood in the context of sustainable development. Chow & Chen, (2012); Widyastuti & Santoso, (2016), explain that the green consumer movement was a form of concern for the environment that raises the green market and green economy which can be modelled by integrating the dimensions of social, economic and environmental development. Ecosystem services provide significant benefits to non-communities and stakeholders who have the rights to the resources, and to balance the relative value of incentives with other tourism revenues. Enviro-preneurial orientation positively influences the practice of adopting green supply chains in a nature-based tourism management system for long-term sustainability et al., 2016). The application of a competitive concept of ecotourism can preserve spatial planning, maintain coastal tourism and aligning policies (Eshoo, 2018; Halim, 2016; Hengky, 2014).

### ***National Competitiveness***

Multiculturalism is a function of an effective public policy tool to improve the competitiveness of a nation (Eddy & Metz, 2015). Not only in the case of goods, it is also important in the case of services to predict the rate at which the country will grow (Stojkoski, et al., 2016). The most important competitiveness of the regional tourism industry is having and maintaining its competitive dominance in many areas in a sustainable manner (Santos S.F & Brandi, 2014; Zilli & Xiao, 2014). Working with Halal principles contributes to the competitiveness of hotels and it has the potential to develop tourism and halal services in Bangkok (Mansouri, 2014). Boşcoianu, et al., (2015); Costea., et al., (2016) states that overall economic competitiveness is based on organizations and tourism institutions.

### **Method**

This study employs Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) with SmartPLS3 software for analyzing techniques. SEM is a multivariate technique that combines aspects of multiple regression and factor analysis to estimate a series of simultaneous dependency relationships (Hair *et. al*, 1998). According to Hair, et al., (2007), a sample size 5 – 10 times as the expected number of model coefficients which is come from the multiplication of 5-10 times of the model coefficient with the total of 79 items of research questionnaire consisting of tourism destination, tourism services, tourism infrastructure, human resources, government policies, and national competitiveness.

### ***Size of Dataset***

The unit of analysis in this study is domestic tourism. Samples were taken purposively from

as many as 320 domestic tourists who had visited tourist attractions in Bogor, Yogyakarta, and Jakarta more than 3 times. To identify the length of time for tourists to visit, tourists were asked in advance how long they are spending at the destination they have chosen to visit. Bogor, Yogyakarta, and Jakarta were chosen because the cities are developing the concept of halal tourism. In addition to the questionnaire, the next research method was an in-depth interview with the head of the acceleration of halal tourism in Indonesia, as well as the Bogor and Yogyakarta Cultural and Tourism Office. This is done to get a completer and more detailed amount of information about the attitudes and actions taken by the government in developing halal tourism in Indonesia. Malhotra (2010) states that the Likert scale should use a 5-point scale, namely 5 = Strongly agree, 4 = Agree, 3 = Neither agree nor disagree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly disagree. All data was processed to determine the validity and reliability of Cronbach's alpha values tested. The alpha coefficient is used as a measurement for reliability and Cronbach's alpha with a value greater than 0.8 is accepted and considered adequate. The results show that the questions in the research instrument are valid and reliable. The type of investigation in this study is descriptive and verification research was used to verify between exogenous and endogenous variables.

### ***Research Hypothesis***

This research carries out several hypotheses in which the main hypothesis is that tourism services, tourism infrastructure, human resources, and government policies all significantly influence the national competitiveness through a green tourism framework.

### **Discussion**

Yogyakarta's Tourism potential indeed extraordinary, but in Halal Tourism it is very complex and has not fully developed yet. The Yogyakarta Tourism Office helps in structuring the city, this is in accordance with the Yogyakarta Tourism Department's vision of wanting to make Yogyakarta as the main tourist attraction in Southeast Asia. It will also collaborate with Sharia Business Institutions (LBS) for the certifications per of each outlet. The Yogyakarta Tourism Office also held the Sapta Pesona Tourism Awareness event, which was an event that focused on cleaning -up of tourist destination destinations in Yogyakarta and emphasised a socialize of the the importance of service, cleanliness, and beauty in the tourism industry. There are several hotels with sharia concepts, namely; Sofyan Inn Unisi Hotel, Namira Hotel, Puri Inn Hotel, and Family Hotel. Sharia market opportunities are quite large and can increase hotel room occupancy in Yogyakarta. Halal certificates are also needed for supporting culinary tourism because the food and beverage products will need to be checked from the procurement of raw materials, the manufacturing process and to through to when the products are ready for use. Yogyakarta has many other tourist destinations including, both natural cultural tourism, shopping tourism, and culinary tourism. The concept of

environmentally friendly tourism can fulfill the following four things; referring to energy management and greenhouse emissions, wise water consumption wisely, the effective management of waste management, and the management of culture and local wisdom. Tourism is not only one way to present an area, but it may also able to conserve the surrounding environment and help to alleviate poverty in the area. In case tThe role of the Yogyakarta government is to be able to combine the environment, sustainable tourism, and social affairs. Thus, the Green Growth Vision 2050 formulated by tourism managers including hospitality, culinary, local communities, tourism agents, NGOs, environmental groups together with the government of DI Yogyakarta can gradually be achieved. Here the role of the Yogyakarta government is to develop the potential of an area that can increase revenue by providing and improving infrastructure, repairing and expanding facilities, promoting and making regulations and policies in providing services to tourists.

The West Java region of the Bogor City is one of the areas that continues to be utilised and developed into a halal tourist destination that can attract tourists who are both local and international to the area. The focus of work and improvement, especially on Access, Communication, Environment, and Services (ACES) are the standard criteria for the Global Muslim Travel Index. Where Indonesia was determined as the world's best halal tourism destination (halal tourism) in 2019, surpassing 130 tourist destinations from all over the world. In 2016, the city of Bogor was a host for OIC countries. In the same year, Botani Square (a mall in the center of Bogor) won the National Halal Tourism competition, and the Best Muslim Tourist Friendly Shopping Center, among other awards because it provided a designated five-time prayer time for its Muslim guests. Botani Square made the relevant call to alert tourists of the prayer session during each prayer time it conducted.

The provincial government of DKI has an exceptional aspect of 3A's, namely the best Attractions, Accessibility, and Amenities, in addition to the infrastructure that is ready and qualified for the development of halal tourism, but in terms of halal products, it has not been optimized. Various efforts to improve halal tourism services have been made by Tthe DKI provincial government, as it has always mobilized hotel and culinary businesses to take care of halal certification. The provincial government of DKI is also making pilots for sharia hotel projects in the Jakarta Islamic Center (JIC) complex, Koja, and North Jakarta, as is the rise of sharia hospitality now in Bangkok, Kuala Lumpur, Seoul, and Tokyo. There are tourist attractions that will also be worked on to so they can become the leading halal tourist destinations, namely the Old City, Pulau Pulau Thousand Islands, National Monument, and Situ Babakan, besides some religious objects that are actually already frequently visited by tourists such as the Istiqlal Mosque, and the Sunda Kelapa Great Mosque.

The 320 tourists who were respondents of this study consisted of tourists who had jobs as private 26%, students 24%, civil servants 12% and the remaining others work in households,

or as entrepreneurs, and etc. The age of tourists was 20 to 30-year old's at 27%, 40 to 50 year old's at 24%, 30-40 year old's at 23% and others under 20 years and over 50 years. The amount of tourist income was; 37% earned between 5-8 million rupiahs, and 21% of tourists earned between 2-5 million rupiahs and between 8-10 million rupiahs, the others in the study earned under 2 million rupiahs and above 10 million rupiahs.

The hypothesis is tested using a statistical test which was presented in the correlation framework between variables. Under the framework, correlation is considered as the structural model equation. Table 1 shows that the five suitability measurements attained good fit results, namely NNFI, NFI, RFI, and CFI. While the other three conformity measurement namely GFI and AGFI attained a marginal fit for the results. Therefore, this model is feasible to be employed further.

**Table 1:** Suitability Size of the Model

GOF Indicator	Size Expected	Estimation Results	Result
Absolute Fit Size			
GFI	GFI > 0.90	0.88	Marginal Fit
RMSEA	RMSEA < 0.08	0.072	Good Fit
Fit Incremental Size			
NNFI	NNFI > 0.90	0.99	Good Fit
NFI	NFI > 0.90	0.99	Good Fit
AGFI	AGFI > 0.90	0.84	MarginalFit
RFI	RFI > 0.90	0.99	Good Fit
IFI	IFI > 0.90	0.99	Good Fit
CFI	CFI > 0.90	0.99	Good Fit

Source: Data Processing Results, 2018

The structural equation model is producing model as follows:

$GT = 0.092*TS + 0.32*TI + 0.28*HR + 0.27*GP$					Errorvar.= 0.42,	$R^2 = 0.58$
(0.16)	(0.11)	(0.078)	(0.082)	(0.053)		
0.57	2.99	3.64	3.26	7.98		

The equation asserts that tourism services, infrastructures, human resources, and government policies contribute 58% for green tourism meanwhile the other 42% of other factors still need to be explored further. With the loading factor of 0.58 and t value of 108.37 is greater than 3.84, this implies that the hypothesis is accepted. Particularly, tourism services do not have an effect on green marketing with the loading factor being only 0.09 and t value of 0.57 which less than t criteria of 1.96, thus the hypothesis is rejected. It can be concluded that tourism

services in Bogor, Yogyakarta, and Jakarta have not applied the concept of green marketing completely. Tangibility, empathy, reliability, responsiveness and assurance indicators have not been put into the form of facilities, attention, responsibilities and guarantees as well toward environmentally friendly of halal tourism services as a description of green tourism. Meanwhile, tourism infrastructure does have an effect on green marketing with a loading factor of 0.32 and t value of 2.99 which is above the standard criteria, therefore the hypothesis is accepted. In line with the human resources, it has an influence on green marketing with the loading factor of 0.28 and t value of 3.64 which is greater than 1.96, meaning that the hypothesis is accepted. Likewise, the hypothesis of government policy is also accepted and has an effect on green marketing which is presented by the attained loading factor of 0.27 and t value of 3.26.

The next equation model is as follows:

NC = 0.11*TS + 0.24*TI + 0.21*HR + 0.26*GP + 0.40*GT,					Errorvar.= 0.12,	R <sup>2</sup> = 0.88
(0.17)	(0.087)	(0.060)	(0.077)	(0.092)	(0.055)	
0.62	2.76	3.50	3.53	4.35	2.19	

The emerged equation model above shows that tourism services, infrastructure, human resources and government policies together with the green tourism contribute 88% while other factors only 12% for the national competitiveness represented by the value of loading factor 0.88 and 476.22 for the t value which is greater than t criteria of 3.84. Therefore, the hypothesis is accepted. In more detail, tourism services do not have any influence on national competitiveness because the loading factor and t value are only 0.11 and 0.62 respectively smaller than t criteria of 1.96, in which the hypothesis is rejected. This data means that tourism services in Bogor, Yogyakarta, and Jakarta as a tourism destination have not been effectively encouraged to the realization of national competitiveness.

Tangibility, empathy, reliability, responsiveness and assurance indicators have not been brought into the form of facilities, attention, responsibilities and guarantees as well which are reliable in order to enhance the national competitiveness compare to other countries. Meanwhile, tourism infrastructure does have an effect on green marketing with the loading factor of 0.24 and t value of 2.76 which is above the standard criteria, therefore the hypothesis is accepted. In line with the human resources, it has an influence on national competitiveness with loading factor of 0.21 and t value of 3.50 which is greater than 1.96, means that the hypothesis is accepted. Likewise, the hypothesis of government policy is also accepted and has an effect on national competitiveness which is presented by the attained loading factor of 0.26 and t value of 3.53. Green tourism has an effect on the improvements of the national competitiveness by loading factor of 0.40 and t value of 4.52 which is greater than t criteria of 1.96, therefore the hypothesis is accepted.

**Table 2:** The Effect of Direct and Indirect on NC through GT

Effect	Direct (D)	Indirect (ID) through GT	
TS → NC	0.11	$(0.09 \times 0.40) = 0.0360$	D > ID
TI → NC	0.24	$(0.32 \times 0.40) = 0.1280$	D > ID
HR → NC	0.21	$(0.28 \times 0.40) = 0.1120$	D > ID
GP → NC	0.26	$(0.27 \times 0.40) = 0.1080$	D > ID

Source: Data Processing Results, 2018

Table 2 shows that there are direct and indirect effects of tourism services toward national competitiveness through the green tourism concept. The direct influence as much as 0.11, while its counterpart is 0.036. This means that tourism services are not significant in the improvement of national competitiveness both direct and indirect effect. Thus, the green tourism variable is not a mediating variable. Furthermore, the direct and indirect influences of infrastructure tourism show that there is an effect with results of 0.24 and 0.128 respectively on national competitiveness. These results describe that infrastructure tourism improves the national competitiveness through the green tourism concept, however direct influence is more dominant. In summary, national competitiveness will be improved if the infrastructure, particularly in the tourism sector is built based on the environmentally oriented the framework of green tourism. This argument is supported by Little, et al., (2012), who stated that there is an influence of infrastructure tourism on national competitiveness and green tourism variable is partially mediating variable.

Furthermore, the results of the subsequent data processing indicate the effect of direct human resources on national competitiveness through green tourism is 0.21 and the indirect influence is 0.1120. These data show that human resources are capable and able to enhance national competitiveness both directly and indirectly through green tourism, however the direct effect is more dominant. Therefore, the national competitiveness will be improved if human resources is developed through skills development in the context of halal tourism with the adoption of green tourism. Moreover, green tourism is a partial mediating variable between human resources and national competitiveness. Other results show that the direct effect of government policy on national competitiveness is 0.26 while its indirect effect is 0.108 through green tourism. It means that the government policy positively increases the national competitiveness both directly and indirectly through green tourism. However, its direct effect is more dominant. Therefore, green tourism is a partial mediating variable between government policy and national competitiveness. This result is supported by Little, et al., (2012). In sum, national competitiveness will grow even faster if the government policy is made to support the green tourism movement.

## Conclusion and Recommendation

In achieving the number of foreign and domestic tourists and observing the potential for the rapid development of the halal tourism industry, DI Yogyakarta is still not optimally working on this to its fullest potential. The development of halal awareness for Muslim tourists, the need for family vacation destinations, safe travel, the availability of Muslim friendly services and facilities in tourist destinations such as halal food, easy access to worship, and services still need to be improved. Although in some of these aspects DI Yogyakarta can be said to be still lacking, but in general, DI Yogyakarta has implemented environmentally friendly practices in the concept of green economy. Based on the observations, there are several obstacles in its application, namely the lack of consistent attitude taken by the management of tourist attractions, the lack of awareness of tourists, the lack of socialization, and the assumption that the application of a green economy that is too tight will actually hamper business and costly. These constraints need to be overcome with the efforts and response of the DI Yogyakarta government that is fast in providing various Muslim friendly facilities in tourist destinations, helping to certify halal for restaurant and hotel managers, intensifying socialization activities and building commitments, because DI Yogyakarta is very has great potential in developing halal tourism. Similarly, the city of Bogor still needs to increase socialization and build commitment in implementing halal certification for tourism managers, with restaurant and hotel facilities. In addition, it also needs to improve the skills of tourism actors with training and certification, as well as implementing a halal tourism marketing strategy as well as forming a green tourism team in to implementing environmentally friendly tourism. The Provincial Government of Jakarta, with its complete infrastructure and facilities, is a pioneer in developing halal tourism. The commitment of the government and the management of important tourism destinations in order to maintain Indonesia's position is determined as the world's best halal tourism destination in 2019, based on the 2019 Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI) standard that has succeeded in surpassing 130 destinations from around the world.

This study implies that halal tourism is environmentally friendly and capable to tackle the challenges in the increasing competition between countries. Through the excellent services, availability of infrastructures, proper human resources, and supporting policies, it will encourage broader implementation of green tourism and expected to lead towards sustainable development tourism and significantly contribute to the national competitiveness internationally. Though, the halal-based sector and environmentally-friendly tourism services have not yet become an advantage for the national competitiveness, whereas this tourism sector contains massive potential if managed seriously. For example, the development of infrastructure supports the acceleration growth of the halal industry, human resources improvement is very useful for the labor competition among ASEAN countries therefore it will enhance the community's income, and government support through good policies will gain positive participation from local communities. However, this study has limitations in



term of the total samples, as well as the research scope but hopefully this study will encourage the upcoming researchers to investigate further for broader regions, hence the results can be more generalized. It is recommended that variables of ecological knowledge and marketing mix strategies are to be considered for this green tourism service discourse.

### **Acknowledgment**

Gratefulness and appreciation are given to the Directorate of Research and Community Services, Directorate General of Research and Development Strengthening, National Strategy Research Grant for Institutional 2018 under the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education of Republic Indonesia.



## REFERENCES

- Andrea, M. B. (2016). Moving towards integrated policy formulation and evaluation: The green economy model. *Environmental and Climate Technologies*.  
<https://doi.org/10.1515/rtuect-2015-0009>
- Biggs, D., Swemmer, L., Phillips, G., Stevens, J., Freitag, S., & Grant, R. (2014). The development of a tourism research framework by South African National Parks to inform management. *Koedoe*, 56(2). Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/koedoe.v56i2.1164>.
- Boşcoianu, M., Costea, M., & Codreanu, A. (2015). Sovereign investment funds and the globalization of tourism. Discussions on Romania's case. *Journal of Defense Resources Management*, 6(1), 85.
- Chow, W. S., & Chen, Y. (2012). Corporate sustainable development: testing a new scale based on the mainland Chinese context. *Journal Business Ethics*, 105, 519–533.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-011-0983-x>
- Eddy, S. N., & Metz, I. (2015). Multiculturalism as a strategy for national competitiveness: The case for Canada and Australia. *Journal Business Ethics*, 128, 253–266.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-014-2089-8>
- Elaziz, M. F., & Kurt, A. (2017). Religiosity, consumerism and halal tourism: A study of seaside tourism organizations in Turkey. *Tourism Original Scientific Paper*, 65(1), 115 – 128.
- Ervina. (2017). Application of tourism development strategies by the Department of Tourism in Kutai Kertanegara Regency. *Journal of State Administration*, 5(3), 6240–6253.
- Eshoo, P. F. (2018). Design, monitoring and evaluation of a direct payments approach for an ecotourism strategy to reduce illegal hunting and trade of wildlife in Lao PDR. *PLoS ONE*, 13(2).
- Farahani, Z., & Henderson, J. C. (2009). Islamic tourism and managing tourism development in Islamic societies: The cases of Iran and Saudi Arabia. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 12(1), 79–89.
- Hair, J. F. Jr., Anderson, R.E., Tatham, R.L., Black, W.C. (1998). *Multivariate Data Analysis: With Readings*. Fourth Edition, Upper Saddle River, New Jersey: Prentice Hall International, Inc.
- Hair, J. F., Money, A. H., Samouel, P., & Page, M. (2007). *Research Methods for Business*.

*Education + Training*, 49(4), 336–337.

- Halim, H. S. (2016). Co-management: Valuating Social Communication of Sustainable Coastal Tourism, in Indonesia. *International Journal of Marine Science*, 6(6), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.5376/ijms.2016.06.0046>.
- Hefer, Y., & Cant, M. C. (2014). Measuring service quality: The student as primary consumer. *International Business and Economics Research Journal*, 13(6), 2151–2160.
- Hengky. (2014). Excogitated coastal tourism competitiveness by implementing eco-tourism in Anyer, Banten, Indonesia. *International Journal of Marine Science*, 4(7), 74–81. <https://doi.org/10.5376/ijms.2014.04.0007>
- Hieu, V. M., & Rasovska, I. (2017). Developing cultural tourism upon stakeholders' perceptions toward sustainable tourism development In Phu Quoc Island, Vietnam. *Research and Science Today Journal*, 2(14), 71–86.
- Hobbs, J. J. (2017). Heritage in the lived environment of The United Arab Emirates and The Gulf Region. *International Journal of Architectural Research*, 11(2), 55–82.
- Hosseinzade, M., Jafari, H., & Ahmadian, M. M. (2018). Rural entrepreneurship and sustainable development towards environmental sustainability (Central Bardaskan City area). *Ukrainian Journal of Ecology*, 8(2), 235–245.
- Islam, M. A. (2013). *Islamic tourism as a prosperous phenomenon in Lapland*. Rovaniemi University of Applied Sciences.
- Jaelani, A. (2016). Islamic tourism development in Cirebon: The study heritage tourism in Islamic economic perspective. *Journal of Economics Bibliography*, 3(2).
- Juan, M. M., Mary, D., Priyanko, G., & Amanda, M. B. (2017). Strategic human resources management research in hospitality and tourism: A review of current literature and suggestions for the future. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 29(1), 48–67.
- Kamali, M. H. (2012). Tourism and the halal industry: A global shariah perspective. *Journal Devoted To Contemporary Issues And Policy Research*, 3(3).
- Kessler, K. (2015). Conceptualizing Mosque Tourism: A central feature of Islamic and Religious Tourism. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 3(2).
- Li, Y., & Hunter, C. (2014). Community involvement for sustainable heritage tourism: a conceptual model. *Journal of Cultural Heritage Management and Sustainable*

*Development*, 5(3), 248–262.

- Little, T. D., Card, N. A., Bovaird, J. A., Preacher, K. J., & Crandall, C. S. (2012). Structural equation modeling of mediation and moderation with contextual factors. *Modeling Contextual Effects in Longitudinal Studies*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203936825>
- Liu, W., Vogt, C., Luo, J., He, G., Frank, K., & Liu, J. (2012). Drivers and Socioeconomic Impacts of Tourism Participation in Protected Areas. *PLoS ONE*, 7(4).
- M. Costea., Hapenciuc, C. V., & Arionesei, G. (2016). Romania versus bulgaria: A short analysis of the competitiveness of seaside tourism. *International Conference On Innovations In Science And Education*. Prague, Czech Republic.
- Makmun. (2016). *Green Economy: Konsep, Implementasi, dan Peranan Kementerian Keuangan*. Jakarta, Indonesia.
- Mansouri, S. (2014). Role of halal tourism ideology in destination competitiveness: A Study on Selected Hotels in Bangkok, Thailand. *International Conference on Law, Education and Humanities (ICLEH'14)*. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.15242/ICEHM.ED0114528>.
- Moyzeova, M. (2018). Inclusion of the public in the natural capital, ecosystem services and green infrastructure assessments. *De Gruyter Open Ekológia (Bratislava)*, 37(1), 42–56. <https://doi.org/10.2478/eko-2018-0005>.
- Munirah, K. L., & Nizam, I. H. (2012). Muslim Tourists' Typology in Malaysia: Perspectives and Challenges. *Tourism And Hospitality International Conference (THIC)*. Kuala Lumpur.
- Murphy, S. E., I, Campbell, I., & Drew, J. A. (2018). Examination of tourists' willingness to pay under different conservation scenarios: Evidence from Reef Manta Ray Snorkeling In Fiji. *PLoS ONE*, 13(8). Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0198279>
- Namagembe, S., Sridharan, R., & Ryan, S. (2016). Green supply chain management practice adoption in Ugandan SME Manufacturing Firms: The role of enviropreneurial orientation. *World Journal of Science, Technology and Sustainable Development*, 13(3), 154–173.
- Nasrin, K., Hassan, E., & Ardestani, A. S. (2014). The study on the effects of environmental quality, food and restaurant services on mental image of the restaurant, customer perceived value, customer satisfaction and customer behavioral intentions: (Case Study of Boroujerd's Restaurants). *Journal of Business and Management Review*, 3(10), 261–272.



- Newton, P., & Newman, P. (2015). Critical connections: The role of the built environment sector in delivering green cities and a green economy. *Sustainability*, 7, 9417–9443.
- Putra, E. H., Hati, S. R. H., & Sri, D. (2016). Understanding muslim customer satisfaction with halal destinations: The effects of traditional and islamic values. *3rd International Conference on Business and Economics: Future Academy*. Retrieved from [www.FutureAcademy.org.uk](http://www.FutureAcademy.org.uk)
- Rajput, N., Kaura, R., & Khanna, A. (2013). Indian banking sector towards a sustainable growth: a paradigm shift. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 3(1), 290–304.
- Santos S.F, & Brandi, H. S. (2014). A canonical correlation analysis of the relationship between sustainability and competitiveness. *Clean Tech Environ Policy*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10098-014-0755-2>.
- Sedarmayanti. (2014). *Membangun & Mengembangkan Kebudayaan Dan Industri Pariwisata: Bunga Rampai Tulisan Pariwisata*. Bandung: PT Refika Aditama.
- Setiawan, R. I. (2016). Pengembangan sumber daya manusia di bidang pariwisata: perspektif potensi wisata daerah berkembang. *Jurnal Penelitian Manajemen Terapan (PENATARAN)*, 1(1), 23–35.
- Shafaei, F., & Mohamed, B. (2015). Malaysia's branding as an Islamic tourism hub: An assessment. *Malaysia Journal of Society and Space*, 11(1), 97–106.
- Stojkoski, V., Utkovski, Z., & Kocarev, L. (2016). The impact of services on economic complexity: Service sophistication as route for economic growth. *PLoS ONE*, 11(8). <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0161633>.
- Suid, I. S., Nor, N. A. M., & Omar, H. (2017). Review on Islamic Tourism and the Practical of Islamic Attributes of Destination in Tourism Business. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(12), 255–269.
- Tawinunt, K., Phimonsathien, T., & Fongsuwan., W. (2015). Service quality and customer relationship management affecting customer retention of longstay travelers in the thai tourism industry: A SEM Approach. *Journal of Arts & Sciences*, 8(2), 459–477.
- UNWTO. (2017). Tourism Highlight.
- Vaghefi, N. (2015). *Green economy: issues, approach and challenges in muslim countries*. Malaysia: Scientific Research Publishing.



- Warsitaningsih, S. (2002). *Handout Manajemen Industry Catering*. Bandung: PKK FPTK UPI.
- Wibisono, N. (2017). Dibalik membaiknya daya saing pariwisataindonesia cmNf. Retrieved from <https://tirto.id/di-balik-membaiknya-daya-saing-pariwisataindonesia-cmNf>
- Widyastuti, S., & Santoso, B. (2016). Green marketing: A study about the factors influencing the repurchase decision of Javanony Herbal Products. *Asean Marketing Journal*, 8(2), 104–115.
- Wuryasti, F. (2013). Wisata Halal, Konsep Baru Kegiatan Wisata di Indonesia. *Asean Marketing Journal*, 2(1), 104–115. Retrieved from <http://travel.detik.com/read/2013/10/30/152010/2399509/1382wisata-halal-konsep-baru-kegiatan-wisata-di-Indonesia>
- Zilli, L., & Xiao, B. (2014). Core competitiveness elements of tourism industry in ethnic villages. *Journal of Landscape Research*, 6(11–12), 19–21.