Role and Function of Leadership Style on Job Satisfaction in Centralised Public Sector Organisations: A Meta-Analysis of Police Institutions

Rycko Amelza Dahniela, aSekolah Tinggi Ilmu Kepolisian, Jakarta, Indonesia, Email: aryckoamelza.stikjkt@gmail.com

This study seeks to investigate the influence and central function of leadership in public sector institutions, by taking the object of study in police institutions in Indonesia. This study was conducted using the perspective of human resource management, by systematically analysing the relationship between leadership and job satisfaction and other antecedents in human resource management. This study was conducted with a systematic review with a meta-analysis approach to reveal the results of previous research and trends in various findings regarding the central function of leadership in the police bureaucracy in Indonesia. The study results also reveal various research outlooks, and their development. Compared with findings in international literature, the results of the study reveal the need for further investigation into several social aspects and the identification of specific work units and roles. The findings contribute to identifying factors related to resource management and leadership in the public bureaucracy of the police, and directing further research to further identify the character of leadership and its influence in the bureaucratic structure of public sector management, particularly in police institutions.

Key words: Systematic review, Meta-analysis, Leadership style, Job satisfaction, Police organisation.
Introduction

Public institutions usually have a tiered structure with centralised leadership. For example, the National Police organisation in Indonesia is arranged in stages from the central level to the territorial level. The central police organisation is called the Republic of Indonesia National Police Headquarters (Polri), while the regional level police organisation is called the Regional Police (Polda) at the provincial level, Resort Police (Polres) at the district/city level, and the Sector Police (Polsek) in the district area (www.humas.polri.go.id). In terms of human resource management, this structure makes management complex and centralisation-orientation is a necessity for managing the behavior of organisational members. In addition to having expertise in their fields, the police profession must behave according to a code of ethics that binds them, therefore every police professional must independently be able to meet the needs of citizens who require legal services in an ethical manner.

Several previous studies have analyzed the role of strategic leadership in public organisations. Rustam (2018), through research on law enforcement organisations in the police environment investigates factors that reduce the perception gap between the police and the public about the quality of police services, specifically the role of innovation capability and organisational culture. As public institutions, the lack of efforts in the management of resources and operations will affect the performance of the institution overall, especially in police organisations. Sukmana and Indarto (2018), take an instance that unresolved cases in the Central Java Regional Police Directorate General of Criminal Investigation has led to irregularities, thereby reducing the trust of the police institution, especially at the regional level that directly handles cases. This showed that the performance in the regional police directorate has not yet reached its optimum, as there are still many cases that have not been resolved properly. Effective leadership must give direction to the efforts of all members in achieving organisational goals. Leadership will direct the harmonisation of the relationship between individual goals and organisational goals. This can be achieved in circumstances where members of the organisation work to achieve organisational goals in an efficient manner.

Several analyses in various countries regarding aspects of law enforcement by the police show the results of a coercive nature that is less acceptable to the public. This lack of acceptance by the community is a gap from the management style that is generally applied in police institutions that allow, and emphasise, the use of force. On the one hand, this encouragement is part of the police work procedures. On the other hand, the public wants a humanist and democratic police in carrying out their duties (Siregar, 2017). The difference in perception has resulted in the emergence of public pessimism and antipathy attitudes towards police services, as well as adding difficulties for the police to maintain public security (Rustam, 2018). In terms of strategic management, Rustam (2018), revealed that the low
The performance of police leadership is caused by the still dominant style of military leadership and weak transformational leadership style, so as to negatively influence or hinder the improvement of quality services. In general, the results show that showing police leadership has an indirect effect on the quality of police services, and there is a significant influence of police leadership on organisational culture, innovation, and a positive impact on quality services (Rustam, 2018). In various findings, there have not been conclusive results in identifying and investigating gaps regarding the relationship of leadership and the consequent factors in the public sector in Indonesia. Using the object of study of police organisations, this study seeks to investigate the influence and central function of leadership in public sector institutions, by taking the object of study in police institutions in Indonesia. This study was conducted using the perspective of human resource management, by systematically analysing the relationship between leadership and job satisfaction and other antecedents in human resource management.

Method

This study seeks to investigate the influence and central function of leadership in public sector institutions, by taking the object of study in police institutions in Indonesia. This study was conducted using the perspective of human resource management, by systematically analysing the relationship between leadership and job satisfaction and other antecedents in human resource management. This study was conducted with a systematic review with a meta-analysis approach to reveal the results of previous research and trends in various findings regarding the central function of leadership in the police bureaucracy in Indonesia. The importance of a systematic review is that the various findings raised can point to the existence of biases, weaknesses, flaws or unidentified relationships and important elements as direction for further studies. Differences in various studies can occur due to differences in design, and sample variations. A systematic review is an analytical investigation of a study problem that uses systematic and explicit methods in determining, selecting and assessing relevant literature. The purpose of this kind of review is to analyse and collect various data and findings revealed from various literatures that contain a uniform focus (Cooper, 2003; Baumeister & Leary, 1997; Bem, 1995). The meta-analysis approach in this study is a quantitative research design that is used to systematically assess the results of previous studies to obtain conclusions about the various studies (Haidich, 2010).

Using this design and approach, the analysis used in this study is an analysis to investigate the influence of leadership and consequent factors in the context of Indonesian police institutions, leadership functions in various police studies in Indonesia, and the relationship between leadership and job satisfaction in the police work environment in various countries. Meta-analysis using a significance value base is used to support the relationship between variables and the finding of findings.
Results

The results revealed several important aspects in the relationship and central function between leadership and its consequences in the perspective of human resource management. The first analysis is about a meta-analysis of Indonesian sources on the influence of leadership and consequent factors in the context of Indonesian police institutions (Table 1).

Table 1: Meta-analysis of the Effect of Leadership on Consequent Factors in the Context of Indonesian Police Institutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Consequents</th>
<th>Analysis tool</th>
<th>Coeff.(S.D)</th>
<th>Significance value</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sukmana and Indarto (2018)</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>satisfaction</td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>2.645 (0.062)</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hefrizon (2016)</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>satisfaction</td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>3.152</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dede (2017)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>org. culture</td>
<td>path analysis</td>
<td>0,382</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>Sig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(pilot study)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utami (2017)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>performance</td>
<td>regression</td>
<td>3.983 (T-stat.)</td>
<td>0,02</td>
<td>Sig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasution (2013)</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>performance</td>
<td>regression</td>
<td>0.358</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>Sig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syahputra &amp; Hasim (2015)</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>performance</td>
<td>path analysis</td>
<td>0.284</td>
<td>0.008</td>
<td>Sig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dahniel (2019)</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>org. culture</td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>3.919</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>Sig</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The meta-analysis has found that leadership in police institutions in Indonesia has a significant influence on several consistent variables in the field of human resources. Some of our findings from the latest literature show that leadership has a significant effect (p > 0.05) on satisfaction, culture, and performance. All analyses are based on the assumption that there is a direct relationship. In addition, various analytical tools from various studies also reinforce this finding. In addition, this finding shows that leadership functions not only as an important antecedent in police organisations, but is also the most important exogenous factor in many studies of human resources in police institutions in Indonesia. It should be remembered that almost all of the literature investigated in this study put leadership as an independent or exogenous factor, which revealed an influential role in managing human resources and performance in this public institution. Most of the findings reveal that
leadership affects job satisfaction. This is line with Sukmana and Indarto (2018), stating that the leadership in an organisation will be more likely to increase job satisfaction of members of the National Police. The police leadership should affect the job satisfaction of its members and should involve subordinates in work matters, the leader should always listen to criticism and suggestions from subordinates, should involve subordinates in decision making, always develop the trust of members, develop skills among members, understand subordinates well, always be valued by subordinates, work with subordinates and be fair to all members.

The next analysis is to reveal the location and function of leadership in various researches with the object of police organisations in Indonesia. In this investigation, in general, several studies have a similar pattern where leadership is considered the most important basic variable and is always investigated in the management of human resources in the police sector in Indonesia eg (Nurhamiden & Trang, 2015; Rodhiyallah et al., 2017; Yulissaudah, 2009). In addition, this analysis also reveals some functions of leadership variable inclusion in the study of human resource management in the police (Table 2).

**Table 2: A Systematic Review of Leadership Functions in Various Police Studies in Indonesia**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Functions</th>
<th>Object</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Position of variable</th>
<th>Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organisational performance</td>
<td>Performance, quality of organisational resources, HR</td>
<td>Syahputra &amp; Hasim, 2015; Nasution, 2013; Rustam, 2018; Hariyanto, 2020; Sukmana &amp; Indarto 2018; Darmawani, 2010; Mahyuni, 2016</td>
<td>Independent / exogenous</td>
<td>Well-established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division of work</td>
<td>Division of labour, task management, character identification</td>
<td>Nurhamiden &amp; Trang, 2015</td>
<td>Independent / exogenous</td>
<td>Developing and need more research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial psychology</td>
<td>Training, coaching, psychology, mental health</td>
<td>Aminah, 2017; Pribadi, 2014; Fitrianto, 2011; Kurniafandi, &amp; Prasetyo, 2018;</td>
<td>Independent / exogenous</td>
<td>Stable and established</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The results of the investigation through a systematic review revealed that the leadership function that was most investigated in most police studies in Indonesia was in the context of improving organisational and individual quality as members of the organisation with most focus on the performance of police units at various levels and individual performance (eg Syahputra & Hasim, 2015; Nasution, 2013; Rustam, 2018; Hariyanto, 2020; Sukmana & Indarto 2018; Darmawani, 2010; Mahyuni, 2016). In the context of such studies, all put leadership as an independent or exogenous variable. From our observations, research that has put leadership in place with its function for quality improvement has been well developed. This is due to several factors. The first factor is that leadership is considered as one of the variables that is prevalent in HR studies, so this type of research is generally HR research, by taking the police as the object of the case. The second factor starts from the general perception of the police institution as one of the public sectors. This directly assumes a degree of centralisation in leadership which is also strong and has taken root in public sector studies. This degree of centralisation of leadership in the public sector is not only limited to the police, but also in various other sectors (Wright & Pandey, 2010; Baccaro & Simoni, 2007; Porter & Olsen, 1976; Singh & Verney, 2003; Peled, 2001), and not only limited in Indonesia, but also in various countries (Reeves & Packer, 2013; Den Boer, 2013; Brockmann, 2017). In investigating this study, there are interesting results from several

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender-orientation</th>
<th>Women's police management and gender-oriented capacity building</th>
<th>Independent / exogenous.</th>
<th>Developing and need more research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yulissaudah, 2009; Dede, 2017; Isnawati, 2006; Yuliana &amp; Yuniasanti, 2013; Manto, 2019; Markuwati et al., 2015; Sarah, 2018</td>
<td>The function is as a research object</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work unit</th>
<th>Police force, municipal-owned police and local police</th>
<th>Independent / exogenous</th>
<th>Quite well established</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indrayanto, 2012; Rodhiyallah et al., 2017; Utami, 2017; Hefrizon, 2016; Hariyanto, 2020; Darmawani, 2010; Rustam, 2018; Mahyuni, 2016; Dahniel, 2019</td>
<td>The function is as a research object</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
studies that the development of social media is an effective effort in the decentralisation of bureaucracy in the public sector, including in the police, and diffusion of governance at various levels (Meijer & Torenvlied, 2016; Reeves & Packer, 2013; Den Boer, 2013).

The results of this study's investigation of some literature also revealed that several other studies that focused on police institutions had a tendency to function in the context of managing the management of industrial psychology (eg. Aminah, 2017; Personal, 2014; Fitrianto, 2011; Kurniafandi, & Prasetyo, 2018; Christine, 2018; Aritonang, 2018; Sarah, 2018) and work unit management (eg. Indrayanto, 2012; Rodhiyallah et al., 2017; Utami, 2017; Hefrizon, 2016; Hariyanto, 2020; Darmawani, 2010; Rustam, 2018; Mahyuni, 2018, 2016; Dahniel, 2019). In both of these functions, the search also revealed that the laying of leadership in these two functions was sufficiently awakened. In this context, this study considers that police institutions have been made as separate subjects, and there are clear assumptions about differences in the management of police resources compared to human resource management in general. It can be seen that in some findings, there is a different focus on analysing human resource management at various levels of police management, and acknowledging the existence of different industrial psychology in police HR management.

Subsequent analysis revealed several leadership functions in human resource management that needed to be further developed, such as gender-orientation with the female police management locus and gender-oriented capacity building. Although this study is already widely available (Yulissaudah, 2009; Dede, 2017; Isnawati, 2006; Yuliana & Yuniasanti, 2013; Manto, 2019; Markuwarti et al., 2015; Sarah, 2018), gender-orientation is mostly only an object of study. Most analyses still place human resource management as a point of view, and have not yet turned to the field of gender studies directly. This is quite different in some international literature, which has accommodated gender in the study of police science (Prenzler & Sinclair, 2013; Morash & Haarr, 2012; Hester, 2013). In these studies, gender in the police is not only necessary in terms of the effectiveness of the implementation of the task, but also the recognition and accommodation of different roles for female police (Shelley et al., 2011). In addition, the analysis also shows that the underdeveloped outlook is regarding the distribution of police duties in the literature of police science management in Indonesia. In this function, not much literature is available (e.g. Nurhamiden & Trang, 2015). In this kind of outlook, leadership is placed as an independent / exogenous variable. The discussion of this outlook is about the division of labour, and management of duties in police organisations. In this function, serious efforts are still needed to examine the division of tasks within the police institution so that future analyses highlight the different character of the division of tasks in the police institution compared to other public sector organisations. In research on HR management in the police force in several international literature, this kind of outlook has been widely recognised which relates not only to the division of tasks from the perspective of
HR management, but also operations and production management (Maguire et al., 2003; Falcone et al., 2002; Greasley, 2004).

**Table 3:** Meta-analysis of the Relationship Between Leadership and Job Satisfaction in Police Organisations in Various Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author (year)</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Analysis tool</th>
<th>Coeff.(S.D)</th>
<th>Significance value</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tomaževič et al (2014)</td>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>principle components analysis</td>
<td>r=0.67</td>
<td>p&lt;0.001</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lee &amp; Moon, (2011)</td>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>B=0.29</td>
<td>p&lt;0.00</td>
<td>Sig. with activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adebayo, &amp; Ogunsina (2011)</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>factorial ANOVA</td>
<td>F (1/346) = 2.16</td>
<td>P &gt; .05</td>
<td>n.s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dobby et al. (2004)</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>descriptive</td>
<td>47% from 1019 respondent was satisfied with transformational leadership</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sušanj, &amp; Jakopec, (2012)</td>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>Monte-Carlo (bootstrapping) approximation</td>
<td>r =-.08</td>
<td>p&gt;.05</td>
<td>Insignificant of passive/avoiding leadership styles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gyamfi (2014)</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>r = .043,</td>
<td>p&gt;0.05</td>
<td>n.s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbour et al. (2009)</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>B=0.36</td>
<td>p &lt; .001</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows that the results of studies in various countries regarding the relationship between police leadership and job satisfaction show mixed results. Several studies confirm significant relationships in several police contexts and research design and analytical tools. Other findings reveal insignificant results, as in the context of the Ghana police (Gyamfi, 2014) and Nigeria (Adebayo, & Ogunsina, 2011). Analysis through descriptive statistics in the UK shows that transformational leadership is perceived well by most police in influencing their level of satisfaction. In another study in South Korea, Lee and Moon (2011), showed significant results between leadership and activity. This shows that leadership is also a central aspect of HR management in the police, where the police with accommodative leadership can influence the level of satisfaction of police personnel. Investigations in international literature in various countries have complemented and supported that leadership is a central issue in police management, as have the findings in Indonesia. This also affirms the importance of leadership in structured organisations such as the police.
Conclusion

The results of this study reveal a literature analysis through a systematic review, the results of which are in the form of a meta-analysis of the influence of leadership as an antecedent for the consequent factors in HR management studies. The first analysis of the influence of leadership and its consequences in Indonesia revealed that leadership has a significant effect on job satisfaction, organisational culture and organisational performance. Most of the findings support the assumption of the central position of the police leadership in the management of police organisations and human resources. Furthermore, the second analysis revealed several important issues regarding the function and outlook of police HR management research in Indonesia. More specifically, it was found that the outlook that has developed steadily in the study of police management in Indonesia is about improving organisational quality and performance. The second outlook that is developing is about industrial psychology and the implementation of human resources in various work units. The findings also reveal the importance of efforts to further investigate the function of leadership in the division of labour and gender-oriented research. Supporting analysis through a systematic review in various international literature revealed that diverse findings were expressed in the relationship between leadership and job satisfaction.

In general, this study underscores several considerations regarding the need to investigate specific fields of HR management in the police institution, and addresses areas of work unit management and specific roles such as female police. Furthermore, these findings contribute to directing management research in the public sector, especially the police, and investigating research gaps that have not been much explored. The limitation of this study is the lack of attention to broader aspects of HR management, where this systematic investigation only seeks to uncover the central function and relationship of leadership with other variables, specifically job satisfaction. The next study is expected to be able to investigate and follow up on these findings regarding the importance of gender roles in the police empirically, and to identify differences in leadership characteristics and their influence in the bureaucratic structure of public sector management, especially in police institutions.
REFERENCES


